

fortitude and strong will, he is stubborn and curious about the world's affair.

In this work there are a lot of different interwoven threads; the plot is set in different places and everything happens during a few dozen years.

To sum up, it is worth explaining the title of this very work and comparing ʿAḥa Ḥusayn to Prometheus. The author hopes that the facts presented make the readers feel sure about this comparison.

ʿAḥa Ḥusayn - Prometheus, a human being of supernatural achievements. It is him who gave people a great gift, showed them what they could not see, the one who "robbed" the treasure house for the benefit of mankind exposing himself to danger. All this was done for mankind - not for fame, popularity or money. People have been given the light - we should pay homage to him. he was an ordinary man and still he was different. His ambition was to be followed by us - to explore the knowledge and pass it to others.

FOLIA ORIENTALIA
VOL. 37 2001
PL ISSN 0015-5675

BRUNO W.W. DOMBROWSKI

QUMRANOLOGICA IX*

James H. Charlesworth and Henry W. L. Rietz (eds.) with P. W. Flint, D. T. Olson, J. A. Sanders, E. M. Schuller, and R. E. Whitaker, *The Dead Sea Scrolls · Hebrew, Aramaic, and Greek Texts with English Translations* vol. 4A: *Pseudepigraphic and Non-Masoretic Psalms and Prayers = The Princeton Theological Seminary Dead Sea Scrolls Project* (Mohr Siebeck Tübingen and Westminster John Knox Press Louisville, Kentucky, 1997) XXIV + 296 pp. DM 168,80 [ISBN 3-16-146649-7]; hence: *Psalms & Prayers*.

James H. Charlesworth and Carol A. Newsom (eds.) with H. W. L. Rietz, B. A. Strawn, and R. E. Whitaker, *The Dead Sea Scrolls · Hebrew, Aramaic, and Greek Texts with English Translations* vol. 4B: *Angelic Liturgy: Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice = The Princeton Theological Seminary Dead Sea Scrolls Project* (Mohr Siebeck Tübingen and Westminster John Knox Press Louisville, Kentucky 1999) XXIV + 196 pp. DM 148,00 [ISBN 3-16-146914-3]; hence: *Angellit*

Paweł Zdun, *Pieśni Ofiary Szabatowej z Qumran i Masady = Teksty z Pustyni Judzkiej* vol. 1 edited by Z. J. Kapera (The Enigma Press Cracow 1996) xxii + 198 pp. + 4 tables [ISBN 83-86110-25-2]; hence *Zdun*.

* "Qumranologica I" in *Folia Orientalia* XXXI (1995) pp. 211-238 plus missing notes on the back cover after p. 260, "Qumranologica II" and "Qumranologica III" in *FolOr* 32 (1996) pp. 165-182, 183-199, "Qumranologica IV" and "Qumranologica V" in *FolOr* 33 (1997) pp. 197-208, 209-222, "Qumranologica VI" and "Qumranologica VII" in *FolOr* 34 (1998) pp. 183-192, 193-202, "Qumranologica VIII" in *FolOr* 35 (1999) pp. 207-223. These review-articles will be referred to, if at all, by their titles only.

The latter years have seen a considerable number of studies on Dead Sea Scrolls (hence = *DSS*) produced by the second and third generations of scholars having become interested in the illuminating documentation bequeathed by Jews other than had been known by our forefathers throughout the history of learning including the time of the first half of the 20th century. It is not surprising at all, therefore, that three major approaches to the *DSS* may be noticed: one intending to offer the contents and forms of scrolls to others for further evaluation, i.e., to carefully translate and explain such (= I), a second one to exploit scrolls and passages thereof to have existing or newly developed hypotheses strengthened or corroborated (= II), and a third to use the first sort to test one's observations and/or thoughts (= III). Obviously, the second one has led many of its representatives or proponents astray, whereas those colleagues employing I and III have made valuable contributions to learning and, especially, our knowledge of the Jewish history during the latter times of the 2nd temple period and early church history.

To the first type of scholarship belong the three works reviewed in this essay, whereas four items of mixed contents will be discussed in *Qumranologica X*.¹

II

The sizable group of scholars having participated in the preparation, compilation and revisions of *Psalms & Prayers* have provided their readers with a monograph of clearness and lucidity which may well serve other volumes as example to be emulated.²

a) An easy survey is offered through the list of contents offered on p. V: After the usual introductory paraphernalia, i.e., a list of contributors, the preface, a foreword (with signa and sigla), a consistency chart, and a list of the abbreviations on pp. V-XX follows on pp. XXI-XXIII a general introduction by the editor in chief **James H. Charlesworth**.

Thereafter the readers are offered texts and translations by **Eileen Schuller** "Qumran Pseudepigraphic Psalms" i.e. an introduction to and presentation of 4Q380 and 4Q381 [on pp. 1-39], similarly by **Peter W. Flint** "A Form of Psalm 89 (4Q236 = 4QPs89)" [pp. 40-45], then by **J. H.**

¹ To follow shortly.

² It goes without further saying that this was possible by the careful co-operation of the publishers only.

Charlesworth and **Dennis T. Olson** a lengthy article on 1Q34-1Q34^{bis} and 4Q507-509 under the general headline "Prayers for Festivals" [pp. 46-105], and another one by **Olson**, namely, "Words of the Lights (4Q504-4Q506)" [pp. 107-153]. **James H. Sanders** and **Charlesworth** together with **H. W. L. Rietz** offer then on pp. 155-215 "Non-Masoretic Psalms"³, i.e. 4Q88 = 4QPs^f, 11Q5 = 11 QPs^a, and 11Q6 = 11QPs^b including a doxology [composed of 11Q5 col 16 and 11Q6 fr f] (pp. 159-161), psalms known in ancient translations (pp. 163-185), i.e. Psalm 151 [11Q5 col 28 lines 3-14] (pp. 163-169), Psalm 154 [11Q5 col 18 lines 1-16] (pp. 171-177), Psalm 155 [11Q5 col 24 lines 3-17] (pp. 179-185), and Sirach 51:13ff [11Q5 col 21 lines 11-17 + col 22 line 1] (pp. 187-191), as well as psalms heretofore unknown (on pp. 192-215) containing a plea for deliverance [11Q5 col 19 lines 1-18 + 11Q6 fr a & b] (pp. 193-197), a hymn to the creator [11Q5 col 26 lines 9-15] (pp. 198-199), an apostrophe to Zion [11Q5 col 22 lines 1-15 + 4Q88 col 7 lines 14 + col 8 lines 1-15] (pp. 200-205), an eschatological hymn [4Q 88 col 9 lines 1-15] (pp. 206 f.), an apostrophe to Judah [4Q88 col 10 lines 4-15] (pp. 209-211), and David's compositions [11Q5 col 27 lines 2-11] (on pp. 213-215), followed by **James A. Sanders**' "A Liturgy for Healing the Stricken (11QPsAp^a = 11Q11)" [pp. 216-233] and **Olson's** "Daily Prayers (4Q503 = 4QprQuot)" [pp. 235-285], and, finally, through an appendix by **Peter W. Flint** a concluding paper "Psalms Scrolls from the Judaean Desert" [on pp. 287-290].

Like the other items in this series this study is concluded by lists of the numbers and designations of the scrolls with the numbers of said volumes.

b) **Schuller** had to wrestle with the fragmentary character of her subject. Nevertheless, she noticed in 4Q380 and 4Q381 the composition of late biblical materials and allusions to thoughts and words used by the members of the Qumran Association.⁴

c) As others, **Flint** has recognised the similarity of 4Q236 and Psalm 89 and compares these items. However, one should probably assume a transformation of Ps 89 and possibly a combination with thoughts of the Qumran Association.

³ To be further discussed below.

⁴ See already her introductory remarks on p. 2. Cf. B. W.W. Dombrowski *Ideological and Socio-structural Developments of the Qumran Association as Suggested by Internal Evidence of Dead Sea Scrolls (= ISD) part II* (Kraków 2000) pp. 84 and 17. — Doubtless we have in Psalm 86 alluded to in 4Q380-4Q381 an Asidaeian psalm whose true character has been misunderstood in the past. I intend to discuss this matter elsewhere.

d) Charlesworth and Olson have followed colleagues through their combination of 1Q34-1Q34^{bis} with the mostly fragmentary items in 4Q507, 4Q508 and 4Q509. They note on p. 48: "...the *Prayers for the Festivals* was composed sometime before 70 B.C.E. Since the *Prayers* probably originated within the Qumran Community, the earliest possible date is around the middle of the second century B.C.E. There is no reason to doubt that the original language of this document was Hebrew. ...The collection of *Prayers for Festivals* was probably not brought to Qumran, but rather was most likely composed there.^{5]}" While some traces of and allusions to the ideology and terminology of the Qumran Association in 1Q34-1Q34^{bis} have been recognised by the contributors, the problem might well dissolve into nothingness, once one disregards the artificial connection of 1Q34-1Q34^{bis} with 4Q507, 508 and 509 which has no basis, except that Charlesworth and Olson argue to find such in the Judaic use of the double 'Amen': "The double 'Amen' appears only five times in the Hebrew Bible while it occurs fourteen times in the extant liturgical fragments of Qumran."⁶ However, this does not suffice for any conclusion.

There is not even cause enough to combine the 41 fragments of 4Q508 and to join the allegedly 312 fragments listed for 4Q509. One need not speculate what else brought the editors and some forerunners, notably *Bilha Nitzan*⁷ as well as *Johann Maier*⁸ to their combination of 1Q34-1Q34^{bis} with said items of the 4Q series. According to their own assertion, it was their thought of "a relationship of prayers and sacrifices in the festival liturgies of Qumran"⁹ and further their guess that "some of these prayers may also have been associated with the Covenant Festival at Qumran." They claim: "many of the prayers stress the remembrance and renewal of the covenant along with the confession of covenant unfaithfulness: »we have forgotten yo[ur] covenant« (4Q509 frg. 18 line 2). The Qumran covenant festival ... is outlined in the *Rule of the Community* (1QS 2.19-25)" which, as the editors feel, "may be a helpful backdrop for understanding some of the prayers in 4Q509."¹⁰ However, the passage 1QS II 19-25a does not concern a *festival*, but it merely prescribes that postulants should

⁵ Here Charlesworth and Olson adduce the objections of Carol Newsom.

⁶ Charlesworth and Olson *ibid.* p. 49a.

⁷ B. Nitzan *Qumran Prayer and Religious Poetry in Studies on the Texts of the Desert of Judah* [= STDJ] 12 (Leiden 1994).

⁸ *Die Qumran-Essener* 3 vols. (Munich-Basle 1995), here I p. 253 f., II pp. 619-641.

⁹ Charlesworth and Olson *ibid.*

¹⁰ Charlesworth and Olson pp. 48b f.

always follow and live by the contents of the rule offered in 1QS I 18b-II 18 and in what order of arrangement they are to come into the covenant.¹¹

e) Olson has taken upon himself to cope with 4Q504-4Q506, a text that is usually called *Dibrē hammē'orōt* 'The Words of the Lights' in accordance with the words written on the back of what is assumed to have been its fragment 8. Assumed these words offer the title of part or all of *these* 4Q texts, it is an open question what *dibrē* means in this context, respectively, what the 'title' stands for, as Olson notes on p. 108. For a metaphoric interpretation as 'Words/Prayers/Liturgies of the Priests' does not appear to have existed regarding 4Q504 any other reason than hyothetic thinking. The text, as it is, was probably of orthodox Jewish origin and fully acceptable to the Qumran Association, though in no way peculiar to its doctrines.¹²

Seemingly much more likely is an origin of 4Q504 or parts thereof, at least in the diaspora.¹³ In fact, to go by their contents, there is no cause to determine the purpose of 4Q505 and 4Q506 beyond their generally psalmodic character.

f) The situation is entirely, even completely different with regard to the non-masoretic psalms offered by *James A. Sanders* together with *Charlesworth* and *Rietz* in several groups. They note on their p. 155a:

"Four scrolls of psalms from Qumran contain non-Masoretic psalms as well as psalms from the MT Psalter....^[14] While others exhibit an order of MT psalms different from that of the received text, our interest here is in what we today would call non-biblical or apocryphal psalms. The Community at Qumran had many hymns and songs other than psalms (*Thanksgiving Hymns*, *Angelic Liturgy* and numerous fragments in DJD 1-7). The Community also had biblical-type psalms which, while not in the MT, were copied on scrolls of psalms along with MT psalms. It is these biblical-type psalms which concern us here."

1) Sanders and his associates begin their presentation with the composite doxology in 11Q5 col XVI. However, they translate רנה in line 2 as, likewise, in 11Q5 col XIX 8 by "a shout"; why not, as it makes much better

¹¹ For the refutation of Weise's construction of such alleged festival see several studies of B. W.W. Dombrowski, especially his *Wider die Hellenisierung jüdischer Religion: Hellenisierung jüdischen Erbes und Lebens* [= *WidHell*] = *Qumranica Mogilanensia* 16 (Kraków 1998), esp. vol II pp. 22 ff.

¹² See already *ISD II* p. 86.

¹³ See *Qumranologica VIII* pp. 221-223. A discussion of some passages of 4Q504 *ibid.*

¹⁴ See above on p. 207.

sense, by "jubilation"? At the end of the passage, i.e. lines 2 f., with its allusion to Psalm 118:15 one should note the Jewish use of the feminine noun יָמִין already in this text governing the masculine participle or the third sing. masc. of the perfect,¹⁵ and so again in fr f, line 2, whereas in line 3 the congruence has been used. There cannot be any doubt that an older text of early Jewry was used by the members of the Association.¹⁶

2) The doxology is followed by another section of 11Q5, namely col XXVIII 3-12, representing one of the versions of Psalm 151 as it had previously been known through the Septuagint and the Peshittā. While the opening sentence of the Qumran text does not represent the same as in LXX and Peshittā with the original opening phrase virtually proclaiming its contents,¹⁷ the 'Qumranic' version of the psalm has seemingly been the most extensive. Moreover the εἰς in the Greek text cited as line 1 by the editors should not be rendered through 'by', but it obviously stands for the preposition ל which was usually intended to designate the dative:¹⁸ 'This super-numerary psalm, [allegedly] autograph, <put in the mouth> of David referred to him, since¹⁹ he (David) fought Goliath singlehandedly' In other words the first line and stanza in the three versions originally indicating the topic of the psalm to follow, was apparently remodelled to refer to its author. This seems to explain also the brevity of the title in 11Q5. Confirmed is this interpretation of the situation by verse 13 of the Qumranic version which relates to David in the 3rd person missing in both the Septuagint and the Peshittā text.

3) In 11Q5 col XVIII a text is offered being parallel to a Peshittā psalm counted as Psalm 154. Obviously the first part of the Syriac text is again a

¹⁵ Cf. A. B. Davidson *Hebrew Syntax* (3rd ed. Edinburgh 1901, impr. of 1964 [cited]) pp. 156 f. [§ 112].

¹⁶ Cf. *ISD* II p. 87.

¹⁷ Consequently it is offered in the LXX text of the Vaticanus and in the Peshittā as head-line.

¹⁸ Cf. the common occurrence of the dative in the psalter according to LXX standing for the Hebrew ל.

¹⁹ For 'when' see, e.g., H. G. Liddell, R. Scott, and H. S. Jones et al. *A Greek-English Lexicon* (9th ed. Oxford repr. 1961) p. 1265a. For the meaning 'since' see ibid. p. 1263a, see further *Chrys. hom. 28.4 in Heb.* For ὅτε with Aorist indicating a definite span or point of time in Ptolemaic Greek see E. Mayser *Grammatik der griechischen Papyri aus der Ptolemäerzeit* vol. II,1 (Berlin and Leipzig 1926) p. 273: "Ob temporal oder kausal, ist nicht leicht zu entscheiden."

secondary headline trying to assign to the psalm a *Sitz im Leben*.²⁰ Consequently not much more seems to be missing in the Qumran version than the approximate equivalents to stanzas 1 and 2 of the Syrian text. Since the extant parts of the Qumranic text and the Peshittā psalm agree in substance, one is probably correct assuming that the parts missing in 11Q5 col XVIII were essentially corresponding to the Syriac stanzas one and two, this the more as the restoration of the word preceding the first line of the Hebraic text is suggested to have been a parallel form to the following הַחֲבִירוּ יַחַד.

The occurrence of the word *yaḥad* with the meaning of the term *Yaḥad* at the end of line 1 and similarly in line 12 being employed analogously to the *qāhāl* of line 10 should be specially noted., especially as the text relates to the קהל הַסִּידִים who may well have been *Asidaeans*. Although there is nothing specific of the ideology of the Qumran Association (measured by the level of QS and related texts) explicitly mentioned in it, and 'wisdom' plays a significant role, while nothing is incongruent or even contradictory to 'Qumranic' thought, the editors have seemingly been correct in dating this text to the third or second century B.C.²¹

4) Confirmed is this interpretation by Psalm 155. Again the head-line of the Syriac text ascribing it to Hezekiah (like Peshittā Psalm 154) is missing in the Qumranic text, and, likewise are the stanzas 20 and 21 of the Syrian version. The editors are correct to note on p. 179b that "Psalm 155 is as biblical and beautiful as many Masoretic psalms."

5) A considerable difference is notable between 11Q5 col 21 11-17 + col 22 1 and its counterpart in Sirach (LXX) 51:13-19 + 30b, in as much as the Greek version has turned the text away from its carnal slant and gave it another emphasis by transforming it to a kind of adoration of wisdom as a means to guide the individual to walk on the path of righteousness. The chance to give it a metaphorical interpretation may well have been the cause for the inclusion of this psalm into the medley of psalmodic literature being used by the Qumran Association.²²

6) The following psalms 'heretofore unknown', i.e., 11Q5 col. XIX 1-18 and 11Q6 fr a and b, the so-called 'Plea for Deliverance', 11Q5 col XXVI 9-15, i.e., a 'Hymn to the Creator', and 11Q5 col XXII 1-15 + 4Q88 col

²⁰ See already Charlesworth and Rietz notes 15 and 16 on p. 175.

²¹ *O.c.* p. 171b. Cf. *ISD* II p. 87.

²² Cf. *ISD* II p. 87.

VII 14-17 + col VIII 1-15, called 'Apostrophe to Zion', are by their origins items composed during the times prior to the beginnings of the Qumran Association during the period of early Judaism. Occasionally thoughts appear which were further developed in the Qumran Association, so in 11Q5 col XIX 1-4 and 14 f. and col XXVI 13 f. The notes of the editors are useful.

7) Somewhat more of the substance of 'Qumranite' ideology is tangible in 4Q88 col IX 1-15, considered by the editors (and others) an 'eschatological hymn', and in 4Q88 col X 4-15, supposedly an 'apostrophe to Judah'. There is no need to assume that the contents of the frolicking text referred to future events - "For he [Yahweh] has come [or: "comes"]²³ to judge all acts to eliminate the god- and faithless from the earth [or: "the land"] and 'sons of disorder'²⁴ are not found...." (IX 5-8) So normality will be restored on earth for those having been down-trodden. (IX 13-14) "nor is Belial found any longer amidst" Judah (X 9 f.).

8) In the collection of psalms offered in 11Q5 was found in col XXVII 2-11 a narrative regarding king David's achievements in the composition of sacred music. It may well have been a learned gloss to the psalter.²⁵

g) In 11Q5 col XXVII 9 f. David is ascribed four songs for "the stricken". On p. 216 Sanders has noted:

"The date of composition may be much earlier" than the script of 11Q11. "There is no reason to doubt it was composed in Hebrew. Since 1988 E. Puech has pursued van der Ploeg's hypothesis that 11Q11 contains the four 'psalms for the stricken' mentioned in 11Q5 XXVII 9-10, and has developed it into a very interesting thesis.^[26] Puech's argument, following van der Ploeg's lead, is that the four psalms identified in 11Q11 constituted a discreet ritual of exorcism which went back to pre-Qumranic Judaism, maybe even the 'hassidéen' movement which gave rise to the Essenes".

²³ Cf. C. Brockelmann *Hebräische Syntax* [= *Brockelmann Synt*] (Neukirchen Kreis Moers 1956) § 41a [pp. 39 f.].

²⁴ On עורל resp. עורלה see *WidHell* through index on p. 375 in vol. II.

²⁵ Cf. what I have said in this respect in the addendum to note 225 in *An Annotated Translation of Miqṣāt Ma'asēh ha-Tôrâ* (4QMMT) 2nd ed (Kraków - Weenzen 1993).

²⁶ Here Sanders elaborates in a note 5 on Puech's various publications on this matter.

While this is a virtually pleasing attempt at explanation, it goes without much ado that it rests on too many hypothetical thoughts to be supposed towards serious consideration or even acceptance.

- (α) Did the Essenes really come from the Asidaeans?
- (β) Assumed, this was so - what did 'the' Essenes have in common with the members of the Qumran Association? If I have counted correctly, the Hebrew word for "stricken" occurs only once, i.e., in 11Q11 col 4 2, and this just in partly restored form.²⁷
- (δ) As much as one can make out there were several psalms combined and their contents varied considerably.²⁸
- (ε) There cannot be any doubt regarding the early Jewish origin of some parts of 11Q11, at least. This may be recognised, e.g., from col IV 4-8:

4:ענל דברי ל[חש בשם יהונה קרא בכנל עת 5 אל השמנים לוא²⁹ יבוא אליך
בלינעל ואמרחה אליו 6 מי אתה נ לצרור האדם ומזרע הקדנושים פניך פני
7 [שו] וקרניך קרני חלונם חושך אתה ולוא אור 8 [עו]ל ולוא צדקה

"Concer[ning the words of con]juration by the name of Yahw[eh invoke at eve]ry occasion the god of heav[ens lest] Beli[al] come upon you, [and] thou shalt ask him 'who art thou' [to harrass³⁰] humans³¹ and the progeny³² of the sacred.³³ Thine countenance is the face of deception and thine horn is an illu[siv]e horn.³⁴ Darkness art thou and not light, [per]version and not beneficence ..."

²⁷ Regarding this restoration, there is disagreement between Sanders (who partly follows Puech) and van der Ploeg (Sanders p. 226 f.).

²⁸ Sanders counts fr A as Psalm I (on pp. 218 f.), col I-IV as Psalm II (on pp. 220-227), col IV f. as Psalm III (on pp. 226-229), and col. V as Psalm IV (on pp. 228-233), the latter he compares with the masoretic Ps 91 (on pp. 230-233).

²⁹ Possible is also אל.

³⁰ Or another verb with similar meaning.

³¹ Cf. 1QS XI 6b.9 f. and others.

³² With partitive מן; cf. *Brockelmann Synt* § 111a (p. 108).

³³ In the Qumran Association its Members. Cf. re. 1QM XII 4 and 4Q491 fr 11 col 19 ISD I p. 150.

³⁴ Here חלום = 'phantom'. All promises Belial may make are null and void. Cf. J. Levy *Chaldäisches Wörterbuch über die Targumim und einen grossen Teil des rabbinischen Schriftthums* vol. I (Breslau 1866; repr. of 3rd ed. Cologne 1959) p. 261b.

While there is no identity attested in foregoing lines with 'Qumranic' thought, it is obvious that accords are struck which could well be found in literature of the Association. To go further, as Sanders and others do,³⁵ I would not venture.³⁶ Especially noted should be, however the impressive proximity of the 4th psalm in 11Q11 and of the Biblical psalm 91 which attests to the accuracy of the transmission of the biblical item, and it corroborates our dating of Dead Sea Scrolls by their contents rather than the script.

h) Dennis Olson has delivered a further contribution by his edition of the papyrus-text called *Prières Quotidiennes* (= 4Q503), using C.-H. Hunzinger's preliminary preparation and the publication through M. Baillet in *Discoveries in the Judaean Desert* vol. VII pp. 105-136.³⁷ Olson has noted, however, that "the arrangement of the sequence of fragments³⁸ and the distribution of the text into columns by Baillet and C.H. Hunzinger appear fairly reliable, although some fragments are difficult to place....."³⁹ Following Nitzan,⁴⁰ Olson then describes the structure of the individual evening and morning prayers:

"Each prayer contains a heading specifying the time of the prayer ('On the ... of the month in the evening'; 'when the sun rises to shine over the earth') followed by the formula 'they⁴¹ will bless and they will answer and they will say.' Each prayer begins with a blessing ('Blessed be the God of Israel who does' or 'has done'). Apparently the blessings are followed by references to the night ('And the night at the beginning of the revolutions of the vessels of light'^[42]) or to the day ('And this day he has renewed for us dominion.....'). The prayers conclude with a blessing to God ('Blessed be you, God of Israel' or 'Blessed be your name, God of Israel') and the formula 'Peace (be) upon you, O Israel.' Divisions between the prayers are often indicated by a mark in the margin or a vacat or both. The repetitive formulae allow restorations when they are anchored

³⁵ O.c. pp. 216 f.

³⁶ Cf. *ISD* II p. 88.

³⁷ And plates xxxv, xxxvii, xxxix, xli, xliii, xlv, and xlvii.

³⁸ By his count 225 items..

³⁹ O.c. p. 235.

⁴⁰ See above n. 7, esp. p. 70.

⁴¹ This translation does neglect to observe that the third pluralis often – so here – expresses an impersonal subject or even passive mood, i.e., "will bless and it is (to be) said" Cf. R. J. Williams *Hebrew Syntax An Outline* (Toronto 1967) § 160 (p. 32).

⁴² However, see the following comment.

by at least one consonant."⁴³

While, by and large, Sanders and others are correct in their recognition of the systematic arrangement of the *Prayers*, one must not exaggerate this organisation to become a matter of principle. So the aforementioned "reference to the night" is attested *only once*, i.e., in lines 8-9 of the reconstructed text of col 2 [3], and the preserved parts of the *Prayers* with their varied assertions leave a good deal of uncertainty. Notwithstanding the *Prayers'* largely fragmented condition, however, note should be taken of Sanders' and his forerunners' correct assessment of the general character of 4Q503 as daily prayers with a liturgic character. Although its contents is not specifically 'Qumranic', there is nothing the members of the Qumran Association did not have in common with their Jewish contemporaries.⁴⁴

i) Vol. 4A of *Pseudepigraphic and Non-Masoretic Psalms and Prayers* closes with a paper by Peter W. Flint "Psalms Scrolls from the Judaean Desert offered as an appendix on pp. 287-290. Particularly notable are its attempt at dating the materials and the substantial bibliography pertaining to his topic.

III

Apart from the paraphernalia on pp. VII – XXIII and on pp. 191-196 being similar to those presented in vol. IVA, the sister volume IVB regarding the *Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice* is composed mainly of two parts, the first one containing with slight supplementations what has been preserved of 4Q 400-4Q407, 11Q17, and Mas1k,⁴⁵ and the second one offering the texts of Sabbath Songs 1 – 13 in restituted condition, as far as this may have seemed possible to the editorial team. In note 1 on p. 1 the readers are advised that the 'chief worker' "C. A. Newsom is responsible for the introduction, texts, and translations of the individual manuscripts. The critical apparatus is by C. A. Newsom and B. A. Strawn. The composite texts are by C. A. Newsom, H. W. L. Rietz, and B. A. Strawn. J. H. Charlesworth has contributed to each part of this work. The final form of the contribution has been conformed to the methodologies and conventions of this series." Supposed the editor of the individual texts in vol IVB has read them with great care, this means that one should turn, in particular, to the

⁴³ Olson o.c. p. 235.

⁴⁴ Cf. *ISD* II p. 85.

⁴⁵ = Masada ShirShabb = ShirShabb i: *Angellit* p. 2a.

composite texts and the introductory and explanatory information. This does not mean that I would adopt the view of Charlesworth that "it is prudent to speak not about Qumran theology, but about 'theologies' at Qumran."⁴⁶ Surely, there has been *one* specific theology within the framework of the ideology of the Association and texts which may be considered typical for this social group,⁴⁷ even though its ideology and theology were somewhat changed from time to time as this is, due to influences of the environment, usual in most, if not all religious bodies. Consequently one can and has to differentiate between materials offered as doctrines and other texts, even though they may have become known, transmitted, or preserved in the Association.

Provided one keeps the specific character of the Qumran association and of its ideology in mind, one may certainly search for elements thereof in the scrolls offering what has been listed as texts 4Q400-4Q407, 11Q17, Mas1k.

Regarding 4Q400-407 and 11Q17, I have marked in *ISD* II on p. 84 these texts as having been of different, i.e., non-'Qumranic' origin, respectively such that had merely been combined with 'Qumranic' thought or materials and/or reworked and scarcely or just slightly used by members of the Association. While I would hold to this definition despite of other assessments,⁴⁸ I did not note anything in the texts of the *Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice* that could be interpreted as being contradictory to or merely inconsistent with the ideology of the Qumran Association as tangible in the QS texts and others of approximately the same persuasion.

This cannot apply, of course, to Mas1k. However, Yigael Yadin in the 13th chapter of his famous book *Masada · Herod's Fortress and the Zealots' Last Stand*⁴⁹ offered several suggestions and concluded that "wohl eine ganze Anzahl Essener am Aufstand teilnahmen und sich mit ihren Kampfgefährten auf den einzig noch verbliebenen Stützpunkt, d.h. Masada, zurückzogen"⁵⁰ and that these Essenes, like Jewish warriors of

⁴⁶ I have found this statement in vols I p. xxii, II p. 2, IVA p. xxii, and IVB p. xxii.

⁴⁷ See, e.g., through *ISD* and *WidHell* [cf. above notes 4 and 11]

⁴⁸ So Esther Eshel ["Prayer in Qumran and the Synagogue" in B. Ego et al. *Gemeinde ohne Tempel · Community without Temple* = *Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament* 118 (Tübingen 1999) p. 328] goes even farther, and she has noted "The Daily Prayers lack specific Qumran terminology, and therefore, one may conclude that the Qumranites did not compose them, and they were part of a wider sectarian lore."

⁴⁹ Of this work several editions and translations were published meanwhile. I have before me the German rendition of the 3rd edition of March 1967 by Eva and Arne Eggebrecht (4th ed. Hamburg 1972).

⁵⁰ O.c. p. 174.

other groups, took their sacred writings with them. Now, if there is nothing specifically pertaining to the Qumran Association in the *Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice* and, on the other hand, the members of the Qumran Association were no 'Essenes',⁵¹ it is seemingly rather feasible to assume that the fragments of 4Q400-4Q407 and 11Q17 and those of Mas1k⁵² were remnants of widely used religious Jewish poetry parts of which came to light by mere chance.⁵³ This situation would then be understood from the common estimation and wide distribution of *Sabbath Songs* among Jewry of the 1st century A.D., at least, and it suits to the presence of multiple copies, of which nine⁵⁴ or ten⁵⁵ pieces were found, in the area of Hirbet Qumran.

It would have been strange, if the *Songs of Sabbath Sacrifice* were unknown or, at least completely meaningless to members of the Qumran Association in view of their estimation and acceptance to membership and incorporation of priests⁵⁶ as well as their explicit angelology which did neither declare them, however, to have been priests nor remove their difference from angels as supernatural beings,⁵⁷ whereas Newsom felt that the "communion with the angels in worship could have functioned as an intense expression of the type of Sabbath piety already reflected in liturgical practices that distinguished Sabbath prayers and praise from those of other days.....The intense preoccupation with the angelic priests, how-

⁵¹ See besides my various comments on this matter, *inter alia*, the summation of J. Zangenberg "The 'Final Farewell'. A Necessary Paradigm Shift in the Interpretation of the Qumran Cemetery" = *The Qumran Chronicle* 8 (1999) pp. 213-218.

⁵² Offering fragments of what has been established by Newsom to have been parts of *Sabbath Songs* 5 and 6 (see her list in *AngelLit* p. 2).

⁵³ As another, very unlikely possibility it has been pointed out by Newsom [o.c. p. 4] following Y. Yadin ("The Excavations at Masada: 1963-1964: Preliminary Report" = *Israel Exploration Journal* 15 (1965), pp. 106-108) "that a refugee from the destruction of Qumran by the Romans in 68 C.E. took a copy of the *Sabbath Songs* to Masada".

⁵⁴ *AngelLit* p. 4b.

⁵⁵ Eshel via n. 48 p. 327 and E. J. C. Tigchelaar "Reconstructing 11Q17 *Shirot 'olat hashabbat*" in D. W. Parry – E. Ulrich *The Provo International Conference on the Dead Sea Scrolls* = *Studies on the Texts of the Desert of Judah* 30 (Leiden etc. 1999) p. 171.

⁵⁶ See, e.g., *WidHell* II p. 25f.

⁵⁷ This holds particularly true in view of the fact that the members of the Association saw themselves in "the lot of the saints and together with the sons of heavens" (1QS XI 7 f. and 4QS D fr 5 with the comments in *WidHell* I p. 200 and II p. 222) and they could in 1QH VI 13 similarly be referred to as "members of your [God's] council and in the lot together with the angels before (you)". In 1QH III 21 f. one reads that the cleansed member should take his position "with the host of the saints and he should come into the Yahad with the association of the sons of heaven....".

ever, suggests that the function of the *Sabbath Songs* be understood particularly in relation to the glorification of the priesthood that one finds expressed in various ways in the late Second Temple period (e.g., Sir 50; *TL* Levi 2-5,8). As the *Sabbath Songs* were used by the Qumran Community, they may have served a more particular function. The sectarian Community insisted that it alone preserved the true and faithful priesthood, even though it could not exercise that priesthood in the sacrificial service of the Jerusalem Temple. For this Community, recitation of the *Sabbath Songs*, with their cultivated sense of presence in the heavenly temple, may have served as a form of experiential validation for the Community's claims to be the true priests of God⁵⁸.⁵⁹

There is not even for this claim any cause in writings of the Association, and it is significant that for support Newsom adduces *non*-'Qumranic' texts which doubtless have been used by members of the Association,⁶⁰ but were, by no means, mental products of this group.⁶¹ Nor is there any reason to go beyond the discrepancies in the terminology and dialectal variations in the *Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice*, noticed by Newsom also,⁶² to come to the conclusions she offered on p. 5 of her contribution that the *Songs of Sabbath Sacrifice* were "an apparently pre-Qumran text which influenced the development of Qumran theological language in the *Rule of the Community* [= 1/4QS] and the *Thanksgiving Hymns* [1QH].^[63]" and that "one should likely seek its origin among the priestly-scribal circles responsible for texts such as *Jubilees* or the Aramaic *Testament of Levi*....". I cannot see how in the "documents", i.e., the fragments listed in my note 60, "one of the characteristic motifs is the comparison of priests with angels".⁶⁴

In the fragments of 4Q400 ff. one finds (assumed) facts and conditions of priests and their activities conjectured upon angels. One is reminded of what is called in Christian theologies '*analogia entis*', and, not withstan-

⁵⁸ In several studies of mine, I have shown that there is no cause to consider the Qumran Association a priestly group. For the position of priests in the Association see *WidHell* II pp. 25-27.

⁵⁹ *AngelLit* p. 4.

⁶⁰ See 2Q18, 11Q5, and 1Q21, 4Q213-4Q214, 4Q540, and 4Q541.

⁶¹ See *ISD* II regarding the texts aforementioned in note 60.

⁶² *O.c.* p. 5.

⁶³ Here Newsom refers in her footnote to D. Harrington 'Wisdom at Qumran' in E. Ulrich and J. VanderKam (eds.) *The Community of the Renewed Covenant* (South Bend 1994) p. 144.

⁶⁴ *Ibid.*

ding Newsom's aforementioned arguments, there is no attestation of an *analogia fidei*. Consequently, the editors have noted in the section "5. Theology" of their "Introduction" not only that the angels were identified according to their status or function, especially, through the application of the term כוהנים "priests" (partly with more specific definitions), but that the "terms for the organization of the angels are similar to those found in Qumran sectarian^[65] literature for both the heavenly and earthly communities, e.g., 'assembly' (סוד, 4Q400 frg.1 2.9; 4Q403 frg.1 1.34) and 'congregation' (עדה, 4Q400 frg.1 1.4; 4Q403 frg.1 2.24). The military and liturgical term 'station' (מעמד) which is frequent in the *Rule of the Community*, the *War Scroll*, and the *Thanksgiving Hymns*, is also used with respect to the angels in the *Sabbath Songs* (4Q405 frgs.20-22 2.14; frg. 23 2.7). In addition, terms for the organization of Israel in the wilderness (פקודים, דגל, מחנה) are also used for the angelic divisions (e.g., 4Q400 frg. 2 line 2; 4Q405 frgs. 20-22 2.13-14)."⁶⁵

However, it is incorrect to assume that the occurrence of these terms does in any way point to a connection of the angelology in the *Sabbath Songs* with the ideology of the Qumran Association, since these very terms were also used by others in early Jewry.⁶⁶ Their attestation in literature of the Association allows to see this body still as part of Jewry of their times, even though it merely represented a special group thereof. One should not construe a meaning of the *Rule of the Community* (QS) which it did not have. It did not "define the Community⁶⁷ in terms of the temple both in symbolic and functional terms" as apparently all of the editors still believe.⁶⁸

These editors of *AngelLit* do no longer claim an origin of the *Sabbath Songs* in the Qumran Association though, they rather feel that "the notion of the" Association's "communion with the angels is to be situated in relation to" the "idea of of the Community as temple" where its members "shared priestly service".⁶⁸ In so far they have passed the level where it was claimed that arguments point to "Qumran as the place where the collection <of *Sabbath Songs*> was created".⁶⁹ How unsafe all claims regarding the

⁶⁵ A mistaken term still haunting qumranological studies. Cf., however, *WidHell* II pp. 208 ff.

⁶⁶ Quotation from *o.c.* p. 7b.

⁶⁷ For עדה, e.g., see *WidHell* II chap. 1 and more often.

⁶⁸ Meant is by this insufficient definition the Qumran Association.

⁶⁹ *O.c.* p. 9b.

⁶⁹ *Zdun* pp. 9 ff., 198 following O. Camponovo *Königsherrschaft und Reich Gottes in den frühjüdischen Schriften = Orbis Biblicus et Orientalis* 58 (Freiburg/Fribourg -

relationship of the *Sabbath Songs* to the ideology and the life of the Qumran Association were can also be learned from Lange's dissertation of 1994.⁷⁰ One example should perhaps be cited: On p. 172 Lange writes "Der paläographische Befund zeigt, dass die Sabbatlieder in der frühherodianischen Schriftepoche (ca. 30-1 v. Chr.)^[71] vom *yahad* intensiver^[72] gelesen wurden als zu anderen Zeiten, da in dieser Zeit fast die Hälfte der in Qumran gefundenen Abschriften entstand."

The problematic situation becomes likewise obvious when one compares the tentatively restored texts and their translations as offered in *Angellit* and by Lange, e.g. of 4Q402 4⁷³ or through Tigchelaar's⁷⁴ column II to be compared with *Angellit* pp. 46 and 154 ff.

Surely, none of those concerning themselves with the *Sabbath Songs* can claim to offer materials of any historical liability except the modest work by Pavel Zdun who mainly used in his licentiate thesis earlier studies of Carol Newsom as basis for his translation and comments.⁷⁵ Since Zdzisław Jan Kapera has already reviewed this study and has described it quite fairly with due appreciation,⁷⁶ it may suffice here to refer to its pages 162-186 which offer in chapter 3 a selection of "theological" issues building on evidence attested in the actually preserved materials. Especially to be noted are pp. 179 f. with the attestations of the title מלך "King" for God which were seemingly unusual for 'Qumranic' assertions, yet in no way a matter of dissense.⁷⁷

Goettingen 1984) p. 274.

⁷⁰ Armin Lange *Weisheit und Prädestination* = *STDJ* 18 (1995). See esp. pp. 171 ff.

⁷¹ If there has been such.

⁷² Lange meint sicher 'öfter' oder "von mehreren Personen" oder "Gruppen".

⁷³ *Angellit* p. 152 and Lange *o.c.* p. 176 with their translations on the pages facing the texts.

⁷⁴ Through foregoing note 55 pp. 182 f.

⁷⁵ Unfortunately, reference to his book of 1996 is missing in *Angellit* of 1999.

⁷⁶ In *The Qumran Chronicle* 7 (Kraków 1997) pp. 253-255.

⁷⁷ This was also noticed by A. Schwemer and the editors of *Angellit* p. 6b: "The prominence of the motif of God as king in the *Sabbath Songs* is striking and distinguishes this work from much contemporary literature."

BRUNO W.W. DOMBROWSKI

QUMRANOLOGICA X*

Four Books of Virtual Importance for Studies in Matters Qumran

Donald W. Parry and Eugene Ulrich (eds.), *The Provo International Conference on the Dead Sea Scrolls · Technological Innovations, New Texts, and Reformulated Issues = Studies on the Texts of the Desert of Judah* (edited by F. García Martínez and A. S. van der Woude) [= *STDJ*] vol. 30 (E. J. Brill, Leiden - Boston - Cologne 1999) viii + 711 pp. [ISBN 90 04 111 557] Nlg 313,00 / US \$ 184; hence *Pr*.

Esther G. Chazon and Michael Stone with Avital Pinnick (eds.) *Pseud-epigraphic Perspectives: The Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha in Light of the Dead Sea Scrolls · Proceedings of the International Symposium of the Orion Center for the Study of the Dead Sea Scrolls and Associated Literature, 12-14 January 1997 = STDJ* vol. 31 (ibid. 1999) viii + 217 pp. [ISBN 90 04 111 646]; hence *Ch-St*

Peter W. Flint and James C. Vanderkam assisted by Andrea E. Alvarez (eds.), *The Dead Sea Scrolls after Fifty Years · A Comprehensive Assessment* Vol. 2 (E. J. Brill, Leiden - Boston - Cologne 1999) XXIV + 816 pp. [ISBN 9004110607 and ISBN 90-04-11061-5]; Nlg 150,00 / US \$ 88; hence *DSS* 50.

* "Qumranologica I" in *Folia Orientalia* XXXI (1995) pp. 211-238 plus missing notes on the back cover after p. 260, "Qumranologica II" and "Qumranologica III" in *FolOr* 32 (1996) pp. 165-182, 183-199, "Qumranologica IV" and "Qumranologica V" in *FolOr* 33 (1997) pp. 197-208, 209-222, "Qumranologica VI" and "Qumranologica VII" in *FolOr* 34 (1998) pp. 183-192, 193-202, "Qumranologica VIII" in *FolOr* 35 (1999) pp. 207-223, "Qumranologica IX" in *FolOr* 37 (2001) pp. 205-220. These review-articles will be referred to, if at all, by their titles only.