

REVIEWS

SCANDINAVIAN JOURNAL OF THE OLD TESTAMENT No 2/1991,
pp. 1—153 [Scandinavian University Press, Oslo] ISSN 0901—8328.

The volume, entitled *Toward a Consensus on the Emergence of Israel in Canaan* contains the texts of papers a symposium under the same title, that was held during the anual SBL/ASOR meeting in New Orleans on 17—20 November 1990. It was arranged by Diana Edelman to sum up the updated knowledge of the question of Israeli settlement in Palestine.

Niels P. L e m c h e, *Sociology, Text and Religion as Key Factors in Understanding the Emergence of Israel in Canaan*, pp. 7—18.

Sociology is an important aspect of an answer to the question, why the Israeli did settle in Palestine at all. The Author maintains, that demographic movements in the 13th-12th century Syropalestine distinctly contradict the theory of nomad infiltration by I. Finkelstein, in favour of G. Mendenhall and N. Gottwald ones. Nevertheless, he does not despise of the nomad part in the process of Israel formation entirely. He also thinks, that the pre-exile religion of Israel was a kind of a west semitic religion, where the most important deity was Yahweh. On the other hand, the Sinai pericope was formed as an answer to religious problems, that emerged after the destruction of Jerusalem, when it already stopped being the god's dwelling.

Gösta W. A h l s t r ö m, *The Origin of Israel in Palestine*, pp. 19—34.

The name of Israel first appears in the Merneptah inscription (1212—1202). A question arises here, what it actually means; the people or territory. The Author thinks, that according to the structure, contents and the language of the said inscription, the word Israel refers to a territory in Palestine, inhabited by the people, whom the name had been transferred onto. Than the historical roots of the Israeli people should be seeked in Palestine, where it si located by the first historical hint in the Merneptah inscription. On the other hand, the biblical tradition on the exodus and the conquest is a „creation story”, expressing belief, that Yahweh created his own people and gave them the land.

Robert B. C o o t e, *Early Israel*, pp. 35—46.

The question what Israel actually was, is the basic one. The Bible and the Merneptah stela suggest, that the early Israel was a tribal entity. The author agrees with N. Gottwald and N. P. Lemche, that the statement refers mainly to

the political identity. Another basic question is a problem, what we actually attempt to learn on the early Israel and why. To explain the question of Israel emergence in Canaan very little may actually be added. The phenomenon of tribe formation and the transformation of the tribal elites into monarchistic ones is fairly known in history. Of much greater importance, however, is the question on how Israel did transform since the times of Merneptah to those of David.

Israel Finkelstein, *The Emergence of Israel in Canaan: Consensus, Mainstream and Dispute*, pp. 47—59.

As long as new historical data are known, new matter to discussion may be supplied by archeology only. That is why the surface surveys undertaken in the hill country should be completed and their final findings published; selected excavations of single-period Iron I sites should be carried out in different parts of the country; the findings of surveys of the Transjordan plateau should be corrected. Of great importance is the clarification of the riddle of the pottery of the „dark age”, i.e. the 10th—9th centuries BC. It is necessary to find the Late Bronze archive; when it is found, the reconstruction of the Late Bronze society, economy and political affairs will be within our reach along with the new analysis of the biblical data.

Keith W. Whitelam, *Between History and Literature: The Social Production of the Israel's Traditions of Origin*, pp. 60—74.

A historian has to determine the social origin of the source, to discover its concealed assumptions and causes for presenting the present or the past in such and not another way. In the case of the Bible it is of vital importance. The historian needs to address the question of how the past was remembered and used in traditional societies. Tradition could have been shaped to satisfy someone's interests, was continually adapted and reworked. When we learn of competing fractions, we are also likely to find competing views of the past. Then the text of the Bible should not be seen as a record of facts but it should be explored for the ways in which it functions or participates in shaping reality.

Kenneth W. Shaar *An Architectural Theory for the Origin of the Four-Room House*, pp. 75—98.

The Author maintains, that the plan of the four-room house originated from the merge of an L-shaped plan and the I-shaped plan, dated from the Early Bronze already. The said merge was feasible in the case, when both the models were practiced in the same region for a period long enough for the builders to become aware of the existence of both traditions and capable of combining their main features.

The plan of the four-room house was then copied by other builders, since it turned out more comfortable than the two previous models.

Douglas L. Esse, *The Collared Store Jar: Scholarly Ideology and Ceramic Typology*, pp. 99—116.

The collared store jars principally occur in entire Palestine except for Philistia, south Shephelah and northern Negev. In the plains they are merely one of many types of vessels, while in the central hill country they constitute a prevailing majority.

There are however no grounds to relate them to any definite ethnic group, moreover, that the ethnic movements and cultural transformations need not occur simultaneously. The ceramics should not be used towards shaping scientific ideology; it is nevertheless an excellent means of providing chronological pegs upon which we can hang our historical interpretation, thus enabling the monitoring the operation of the economic system of production and distribution in the broader social and cultural context.

Eckart Otto, *Techniques of Redaction of Legal Regulations of Israeli Books of Law as Edited by the Prophet Micah* [in German], pp. 119—150.

In editing of the Book of Micah the technique was applied of alternate occurrence of legal regulations derived from, among the other things, Mesopotamian codes of law, also appearing in the legal parts of the Old Testament. It serves soothing the theologic tensions between the matter of threat and promise.

Owing to the knowledge of techniques of redaction legible from the structure of the text the theory of diachronics of the text of the Book of Micah may gain reliability. This simultaneously stresses the importance of the final text of the Book of Isaiah for the redaction of the Book of Micah.

Hanna Nowakowska

Lawrence T. Geraty, Larry G. Herr, ed. *The Archaeology of Jordan and Other Studies Presented to Siegfried H. Horn Professor Emeritus of Archaeology and History of Antiquity*, Andrews University, Berrien Springs, Michigan, Andrews University Press, Berrien Springs, Michigan 1986, pp. 732, ISBN 0-943872-27-8, Price: \$49.95.

Siegfried Herbert Horn, native of Germany, was born in 1908. In his early years he was a minister in Netherlands and a missionary in the Dutch East Indies. In 1940 he was interned by the allies in Indonesia and India for six years. He started his formal archaeological career having been almost forty years of age. Siegfried Horn is known in scholarly circles specially as a director of the dig at Tell Hesbân in Jordan (1968—1973) which educated in field archeology many scholars who have largely contributed to this volume. S. Horn retired in 1976 from Andrews University where he had taught for 25 years.

This Festschrift was planned to come out on the occasion of his retirement but eventually appeared ten years after. L.T. Geraty, the editor of the volume and Horn's student, is aware of all the shortcomings which have arisen from the delay. He mentions them in the Preface so there is no need to list them here. In the Preface one also can find a short vitae of Siegfried Horn.

Twenty eight articles are grouped in six topical chapters: "The Archaeology of Jordan", "Biblical Archaeology and Method", "Cities and Structures", "Cemeteries and Ceramics", "Inscriptions and Philology", and "History and Old Testament".

For the purpose of this review we will list the articles here, following geographical order, and summarize some of them:

Archaeology, paleography and history of Transjordan: L.T. Geraty, L.A. Willis, "The History of Archaeological Research in Transjordan" (3—72); Ø.S. LaBianca, in "The Diachronic Study of Animal Exploitation at Hesbân" (167—181), presents a theoretical explanation of an evolution of treating animal bone data by the Hesbân dig from a mere analysis to the study of the "environmental and anthropological contexts of animal exploitation"; B. De Vries, "The Islamic Bath at Tell Hesban" (223—235); B. van Elderen, "Byzantine Churches and Mosaics in Transjordan" (237—246); U. Lux-Wagner, "Ein Bemaltes Grab in Som, Jordanien" (287—300); J.A. Sauer, a specialist in Transjordanian pottery, characterizes technique, surface treatment, forms, and distribution of pottery from an early Islamic period in "Umayyad Pottery from Sites in Jordan" (301—330); H.O. Thompson, "An Iron Age Tomb at Madaba" (331—363); M. Dahood, in "The Moabite Stone and Northwest Semitic Philology" (429—441), analyzes the relations between the Moabite dialect and other Northwest Semitic dialects. He proves that apart from books and articles on the Mesha inscription we have been flooded by from the time of its discovery in 1868, much has to be done in this discipline; F. Zayadine, "A Symposiarch from Petra" (465—474), reexamines a Nabataean inscription of the First Century A.D. from Beida which sheds light on the religious life in Petra; F.M. Cross, in "An Unpublished Ammonite Ostrakon from Hesbân" (475—489), apart from presenting the last Hesbân ostrakon discovered in 1978, summarizes a history of the Ammoonite script to which he has included inscriptions from Hesbân ostraca. Recently, however, a voice have appeared that all the ostraca found at Hesbân are Moabite and not Ammonite [U. Hübner, *Die ersten moabitischen Ostraka*, „*Zeitschrift des Deutschen Palästina Vereins*“ 104 (1988): 68—73]; W.F. Albright, "Notes on Ammonite History" (503—509) [Reprinted from *Miscellanea Biblica B.Ubach*, R.M. Diaz, ed., *Scripta et Documenta* 1, Montserrat, Spain 1953];

Archaeology, Paleography and history of Western Palestine/Israel: J.S. Holladay Jr., in a detailed article "The Stables of Ancient Israel. Functional Determinants of Stable Construction and the Interpretation of Pillared Building Remains of the Palestinian Iron Age" (103—165), strongly defends and old hypothesis that tripartite pillared buildings, with a famous structure from Megiddo, were in fact stables; W.G. Dever, "Abel-beth-ma'acah: Northern Gateway of Ancient Israel" (207—222); R.S. Boraas, "Iron I A Cermics at Tell Balatah: A Preliminary Examination" (249—263); L.G. Herr, "A Seventh Century B.C. Tomb Group From Tekoa" (265—285); K. Vine, G. Hartelius, "Ceramic Lamps from the Hippodrome of Caesarea Maritima — 1974" (365—426); G. Garbini, "Philistine Seals" (443—448), challenges a general opinion that the "Philistines did not make

seals of their own" and recognizes, mainly on the basis of iconography, 19 potential Philistine seals; G.E. Mendenhall, "Cultural History and the Philistine Problem" (525—546), traces the origin and history of the Philistines; E.R. Thiele, who established a sound chronology of the Hebrew kings having based on the Biblical numbers (*The Mysterious Numbers of the Hebrew Kings*, New Revised Edition, Grand Rapids 1983) discusses in "Two Assyrian Synchronisms with Jehoash and Menahem" (601—619) new synchronisms with Biblical chronology. Thiele demonstrates, using many diagrams and charts, that new data positively tests his chronological pattern;

Egypt: R.M. Little, "George Andrew Reisner and His Contemporaries" (183—204), examines superb methods used by this Egyptologist in excavation in Egypt and Palestine (Samaria) as against those of other contemporary field archaeologist such as W.F. Petrie, G. Steindorf, W.S. Smith, and R.A.S. Macalister; W.H. Shea, "Proto-Sinaitic Inscription 357" (449—464);

Mesopotamia: C.E.S. Gavin, D.L. Stein, "Seals from Sippar at Andrews and Harvard" (491—499); R.F.G. Sweet, "Some Observations on the Edict of Ammisaduga Prompted by Text C" (579—600).

Archaeology and the Bible: C.M. Bennet, "Biblical Traditions and Archaeological Results" (75—83), tries to relate archaeological sites, Umm el-Biyara, Tawilan, and Buseirah with Biblical towns of Sela, Têman, and Bozrah. She comes to positive verification only in the last instance; A.E. Glock, in "Biblical Archaeology, An Emerging Discipline" (85—101), argues that a term "biblical archaeology" should not be abandoned, as some scholars have proposed, though our perspective of it is in a need of being modified. Therefore he defends a thesis that, "Biblical Archaeology is a sub-discipline of biblical studies and not of archaeology". One should agree with this assertion.

Biblical Studies (exegesis and theology): G.F. Hasel, "Remnant' as a Meaning of 'Ah'rît" (511—524); J. Neuffer, "An Egyptian Time Scale and Old Testament Chronology" (547—578) discusses modern accusations against trustworthiness of "Ptolemy's Canon in *Almagest* for reconstruction of Near Eastern and Old Testament Chronology; S.D. Waterhouse, "The River-Dragon: Its Meaning in Scripture" (621—638).

The "Selected Bibliography of Siegfried H. Horn to 1985" (641—691) compiled by L.G. Running, B.U. Currie is organized into six divisions: "Books and monographs" (25 positions — scholarly and popular books with many revised editions and translations), "Contributions to Others' Books" (76 positions), "Scholarly Periodical Articles" (47), "Serious Articles in Denominational Periodicals" (441), "Book Reviews" (81), "Unpublished Materials" (3). One can see that popularization played an important role in S. Horn's scholarly activity.

A list of abbreviations used in the volume and index complete the *Festschrift*.

Dr. Siegfried Horn, approaching now his 85th birthady, in spite of a serious accident and disability which happened in 1990, is still active. One would only wish that because so much have happened in the Archaeology of

Jordan in recent years, in many aspects thanks to Dr. Horn's students, another volume dedicated to Him, but now without any delay in publication, would be very welcome.

September 1991

Bogusław Dąbrowski

Lawrence T. Geraty, Larry G. Herr, Øystein S. LaBianca, Randall W. Younker, eds., *Madaba Plains Project I: The 1984 Season at Tell el-ʿUmeiri and Vicinity and Subsequent Studies*, Andrews University Press in cooperation with the Institute of Archaeology, Berrien Springs, Michigan 1989, pp. xii + 632, ISBN 0-943872-96-0, Price: \$50.

Since 1984 an archaeological expedition from Andrews University, Michigan, (which is known under the name "Madaba Plains Project", further MPP), with Lawrence T. Geraty as Senior Director and Larry G. Herr as Chief Archaeologist, has been excavating at Tell el-ʿUmeiri and neighboring sites in Jordan. The dig has been working in cooperation with Jordanian Department of Antiquities and American Center of Oriental Research. Preliminary reports from the 1984, 1987 and 1989 seasons have been appearing in such journals as „*Andrews University Seminary Studies*,” „*Annual of the Department of Antiquities of Jordan*”, and „*Bulletin of the American Schools of Oriental Research Supplement*”.

The volume under review, dedicated to Dr. Adnan Hadidi, former Director-General of the Department of Antiquities of Jordan, is a full report of the first, 1984 season. Twenty three authors from universities, colleges and seminaries of North America, Europe, and Australia contributed to the volume.

The report consists of six parts pertaining to different aspects of the work. In Part One (Pp. 1—19) all four editors present "An Overview of Goals, Methods, and Findings". One cannot overlook particular concern in "food system" a concept which, thanks to a dig anthropologist, Ø.S. LaBianca, has played a major role in setting up goals by the MPP. Food system "consists — in words of the editors — of all of the purposive, institutionalized, and interconnected activities people carry out in their quest for food" (p. 5). An impact of the so called "new archaeology" with its anthropological and sociological interest is clearly visible and the editors emphasize it. The multidisciplinary character of the expedition is stressed here and the content of the report testifies this claim.

Part Two (Pp. 21—210) is one which, from the point of view of goals set up and methods used in the research, should require special attention. It deals with research of the ʿUmeiri hinterland. Three chapters, "Random Square Survey in the el-ʿUmeiri Region", "Site Survey in the el-ʿUmeiri Region", and "Towers in the Region Surrounding Tell Umeiri" describe results of two kinds of archaeological surveys within a 5-km radius of Tell el-ʿUmeiri. One of them, consisting of examination of randomly selected squares each measuring

200 × 200 m, is an innovations of the MPP introduced in the field of Syro-Palestinian archaeology.

Two chapters, "Charles Warren's Explorations between Naʿur and Khirbet as-Suq" and "Yadudeh: The Modern History of its People" address questions on the history of the region.

Further chapters of Part Two, where one can see application of diverse disciplines of science, report conclusions of environmental and ethnographic surveys: "Present and Past Plant Communities of the Tell el-ʿUmeiri Region", "Available Water Resources and Use in the el-ʿUmeiri Region", "Geophysical Exploration", "An Examination of the Valley South and West of Tell el-ʿUmeiri", and "Dental Enamel Defects Among Contemporary Nomadic and Sedentary Jordanians".

The results of the excavation of four Fields (A-D) on Tell el-ʿUmeiri compose Part Three, "The Tell" (Pp. 211—295). Pottery from every period, starting with Early Bronze up to Ayyubid/Mamluk, was found on the Tell. Major architectural remains date mainly to the late Iron II/Persian period. They are attributed to the Ammonites, who were the predominant ethnic entity in this region in the first half of the first millennium B.C.

"The Pottery Finds" and "ʿUmeiri Objects" are the two chapters comprising Part Four, "The Finds" (pp. 297—366). L.G. Herr of Canadian Union College, the author of the former chapter, is one of the best expert in pottery of Central Transjordan. More attention was given to the late Iron II pottery forms and the problem of distinguishing typical Ammonite forms. The latter chapter lists other small finds with focus on jewelry, most likely not because of a significant position of jewelry among other finds but because of preferences of the author, Elizabeth Platt.

Part Five, "The Inscriptions" (Pp. 367—384), contains three chapters, two of them discussing the Baal-yasha seal impression, one of the most interesting finds of the first season at Tell el-ʿUmeiri mentioning an Ammonite king whose name also appears in the Bible (Jer. 40:14) in the form of Baalis.

The chapter about cylinder seals should probably have been included in Part Four, since both discussed cylinders do not bear any inscription. About Cylinder Seal No. 49 (Fig. 23.1), Edith Porada, the author of this chapter, writes: "No parallels are known for this composition, nor for the posture of the bulls..." This information, however, requires reconsideration. Cylinder Seal No. S977/S4 unearthed at Tell es-Saʿidiyeh, which E. Porada accidentally or not, examined herself, reveals basically the same composition of the scene (James B. Pritchard, *Tell es-Saʿidiyeh. Excavations of the Tell. 1964–1966*, University Museum Monograph 60, Philadelphia 1985, p. 87, Fig. 173:2 = *ANEP* 860). Similarities between the two scenes can add some thoughts to the question of cultural interactions between Central Transjordan and the Central River Jordan Valley.

Centimeters instead of millimeters fit better for numbers given as dimensions of seals in this chapter (p. 381).

Six appendices (A-F) (pp. 385—632) make the sixth part of the report. Two of them describe the advantages of using computers and video in an

archeological dig. "Archaeological Excavation Data Management System" describe a computerized system created for and used by the Madaba Plains Project. Three other appendices, "Introduction to the Locus Summaries", "Field Reading Summaries: Fauna and Flint" and "Carbonized Seeds" illustrate how a uniform application of computerized data management works. Without question proper recording of every information obtainable through excavation is pivotal for MPP staff.

Plates with photos, drawings, and diagrams are not placed at the end of the volume as is usual for archaeological records but are interspersed with the text. This arrangement is more preferable for a reader.

Special recognition requires the publishing policy adopted by the editors. Preliminary reports of every season have been coming out less than a year after end of a given season. This volume, being an exhaustive report of the first season, appeared only five years after this season. After terminating the excavations the series of volumes from Tell el-Umeiri will not cease but will be continued with synthesis, monographs, and other studies extending and reexamining data and interpretations presented in earlier volumes.

We strongly recommend this volume for scholars interested in Syro-Palestinian archaeology, as an example of team-work and good editorship. The creativity of MPP staff in adopting new thoughts and tools in archaeology and revealed in this volume is worthy of recognition.

September 1991

Bogusław Dąbrowski

John R. Bartlett, *Edom and the Edomites* (Journal for the Study of the Old Testament Supplement Series, 77; JSOT/Palestine Exploration Fund Monograph Series, 1) Sheffield Academic Press (JSOT Press), Sheffield 1989, ISSN 0309-0787, ISBN 1-85075-205-2, Price: £18.50/\$28.50 (cloth).

Since the 1960s John Raymond Bartlett of Trinity College, Dublin, has been researching the land and peoples of Edom. His papers have appeared in such journals as *"Journal of Theological Studies"*, *"Palestine Exploration Quarterly"*, *"Zeitschrift für die Alttestamentliche Wissenschaft"*, and *"Journal for the Study of the Old Testament."* He also has contributed to several books. He certainly can be called the best expert in the history of Edom. This book, then, is an obvious consequence of his work which would materialize sooner or later.

No one could write an updated history of a Levantine territory and its people if he has not utilized an increasing amount of archaeological evidence. J. Bartlett, being rather a biblical scholar than a field archaeologist, does so with very good effects.

The volume commences with a chapter on "The Exploration of Edom" (pp. 15—32) which discusses a history of research in Edom starting with the first travels at the beginning of the nineteenth century up to modern archaeological expeditions.

Chapters 2 and 3 (33—65) deal with geography and environment of the land as well as with settlements from the prehistoric times (Lower Palaeolithic) up to the Middle Bronze Age.

The history of the Edomites from the late second millennium to the Persian Period is presented in Chapters 4-9 (67—174). As usually, much controversy is connected with the rise and decline of the Edomites and its culture. Bartlett seems to correctly stress that the development stimulated by socio-economic factors of an indigenous population of the Late Bronze Age, played more important role in the emergence of the Edomites than any invasion of peoples from outside.

Chapter 11 (175—186) presents the attitude of biblical writers toward Edom, a bond of brotherhood and hate, over the history of mutual relations between Judah and its neighbor.

Chapter II (187—207) discusses "Religion in Edom". Bartlett rightly employs this designation in a title of the chapter because this is more appropriate from the point of view of archaeology than "Edomite Religion" or "Religion of the Edomites". He lists and examines the architectural and artefactual evidence which can have some bearing on a reconstruction of a religious cult in that territory. Biblical statements have led the author to the conclusion that "Edom's religion may not have differed very much from that of Israel and Judah" (p. 187).

"Inscriptions from Edom" is the last chapter of the synthesis (209—228). Ten seals, eight "incised inscriptions", a cuneiform tablet, and three weights are listed here. Bartlett seems to agree with a thesis of autonomous existence of Edomite script.

Two maps, bibliography (223—261), and four indexes, of biblical references, authors, names and places, complete the book.

For years scholars have put more interest in history and culture of Western Palestine/Israel. Syntheses of ancient history of Israel and Judah have been appearing almost every year. The archaeological work in Transjordan is much behind what has been done across the River Jordan. Therefore a synthesis of the history of Edom by Bartlett is of great importance. This book is necessary reading for biblical scholars and archaeologists interested in Syro-Palestine. The book can serve as a textbook and compendium of information for students of the history of Transjordan. Ideas proposed in the book will be a basis for further scholarly investigation. One would only wish that similar, perhaps more multidisciplinary, syntheses of the history and culture of two northern neighbors of Edomites in the Iron Age, the Moabites and Ammonites, will appear.

September 1991

Bogusław Dąbrowski

Pharaohs and Mortals: Egyptian art in the Middle Kingdom. Catalogue by Janine Bourriau; with a contribution by Stephen Quirke [Fitzwilliam Museum publications]. Exhibition organized by the Fitzwilliam Museum Cambridge 19

April to 26 June, Liverpool 18 July to September 1988. Cambridge University Press, Fitzwilliam Museum, Cambridge 1988 (and reprinted 1989), pp. VI+167. ISBN 0 521 35846 9.

After a catalogue of the exhibition *Umm el-Ga'ab: Pottery from the Nile Valley before the Arab conquest* (Cambridge 1981), also prepared by Janine Bourriau, we have another volume in which an analogous conception has been consistently employed: the accumulation of possibly whole material, its profound analysis and interpretation, and then the arriving at more general conclusions. In this case, the author has focused her interest upon the art of the Middle Kingdom (2033—1650 B.C.), having based on the objects from the Fitzwilliam Museum's own collection [as, for example, in the case of sculpture, a famous granite head of king Senusret III (Cat. No. 28) and a limestone head of Amenemhat III (Cat. No. 31), and also the objects Cat. Nos. 29 and 30], supplemented by the objects from the other collections in the United Kingdom (cf. the enumeration, p. IV).

The catalogue embraces 191 objects of different categories (sometimes one number covers a group of objects, e. g. several scarabs, amulets or beads), described and depicted in detail (some have additional colour photographs, cf. plates I—IV). This list includes the objects of sculpture (Cat. Nos. 1—58), those pertaining to writing and literature (Cat. Nos. 59—66), funerary art (Cat. Nos. 67, 97), a very important group concerning art and magic (Cat. Nos. 98—121), and a chapter on decorative arts (Cat. Nos. 122—191) including important entries on cosmetic pots and other cosmetic objects, on jewellery, amulets and pendants, beads and scarabs.

The chapter deserves particular attention that pertains to royal and private sculpture (pp. 10—73), and whose intrinsic division is based on the distinction of three development stages: 1) Dynasty XI — Early Dynasty XII (Nebhepetre Montuhotep to Senusret II, 2033—1862 B.C.); 2) Late Dynasty XII (Senusret III to Sobeknofru, 1862—1787 B.C.); Dynasty XIII, 1786—1650 B.C.

Summing up, the catalogue under review represents an up-to-date compendium and handbook embracing the fundamental problems of Egyptian art in the Middle Kingdom (in the matter of fact, only with the exception of architecture), and considerably extends the image of art and culture of the said period.

June 1991

Joachim Śliwa

Birgit Schlick-Nolte, Vera von Droste zu Hülshoff, *Skarabäen, Amulette und Schmuck* [Liebieghaus — Museum Alter Plastik. Frankfurt am Main. Wissenschaftliche Kataloge herausgegeben von Herbert Beck. Ägyptische Bildwerke. Band I]. Verlag Gutenberg. Melsungen 1990, pp. 454. ISBN 3-87280-053-1. Price: DM 280, —

A large collection of Egyptian art from Liebieghaus in Frankfurt, containing about 900 objects, has hitherto been known mainly from a publication

covering the selection of 52 most important and representative pieces (*Ägyptische Kunst in Liebieghaus*, 1981). Therefore, an initiative should be hailed which aims at a thorough description of the entire Egyptian collection. It is only recently that 483 minor objects have been presented in a separate volume of extremely careful editorship, including scarabs and scaraboids (Nos. 1—131), amulets (Nos. 132—394), minor decorations and necklaces (Nos. 395—454) and moulds (Nos. 455—483).

All these are mass-produced objects, devoid of the data on their provenance, since they come from numerous private collections of Frankfurt bourgeois families, whose representatives many a time travelled to Egypt, and donated the objects acquired there to public collections, as e.g. Eduard Rüppel, 1794—1884 (the catalogue text is introduced by a competent outline of collection's history, written by Beatrix Gessler-Löhr, pp. 13—18).

The description of the collection of scarabs and scaraboids is exemplary, yet regrettably chronologically limited (mainly the times of the 18th Dynasty — Late Period), and it does not contain the items bearing official titles and private names. Here, rich bibliography of subject has been used in an excellent way, with each object accompanied by a possibly great number of parallels enabling the dating and evaluation of particular items. The objects are perfectly illustrated (apart from the photographs, often with additional drawings).

Amulets and moulds make a very important category, also presented in an exhaustive and versatile way with a tendency to a possibly thorough dating (which is considerably more difficult than in the case of the scarabs). Apart from the work by C. Müller — Winkler [*Die ägyptischen Objekt-Amulette*, 1987] and by Ch. Herrmann [*Formen für ägyptische Fayencen*, 1985], the objects published here, together with some typological and chronological proposals, will rank among basic comparative material, facilitating further research in this respect.

The catalogue under review distinguishes itself through very detailed descriptions of objects, and the tendency to their possibly exact dating is also valuable. The categories of Egyptian objects taken into account here have received a competent treatment, thus augmenting important comparative material for scholars dealing with Egyptian scarabs and amulets. Before long, further volumes of the currently commenced series are to be expected, equally carefully edited and published.

June 1991

Joachim Śliwa

Gay Robins (ed.), *Beyond the Pyramids. Egyptian Regional Art from the Museo Egizio, Turin* [Emory University Museum of Art and Archaeology, Atlanta, Museo Egizio di Torino]. With contributions by Elvira d'Amicone, Anna Maria Donadoni Roveri, Barry J. Kemp, Enrichetta Leospo, Gay Robins, Donald B. Panel. Atlanta 1990, pp. 95.

Here comes the catalogue of the exhibition of Turin objects, presented in 1990 at Emory University, Atlanta. The exhibition was very absorbingly designed as a documentation of Egyptian regional art „to shed light on the art and archaeology of ancient Egypt outside of the royal court, or beyond the pyramids”. This conception is immensely interesting, and the said printed catalogue is of great significance, being an important documentation so different from classic catalogues, presenting the art under Tutankhamun or Ramses II. The present work is rather devoid of masterpieces, but familiarizes us with the present day of the ancient Egyptian man in the street.

The catalogue list proper (pp. 67–92) contains the descriptions and photographs of 54 objects since the First Intermediate Period through the Middle Kingdom to the times of the 18th Dynasty (colour photographs of all objects, cf. pp. 51–64). On the other hand, the earlier parts (pp. 39–50) cover the cultural setting and historical problems of the period, and subsequently provide topographical and historical information of the three important regional centers, from where come the objects exhibited in Turin: Gebelein, Qaw el-Kebir and Assiut. This section closes with the remarks on the Theban relief of pre-unification time and with the description of the tombs and their furnishings.

The publication of the so designed and carefully printed catalogue was indeed a very important idea, since only few scholars were able to see the said exhibition. The catalogue will remain a significant source and one of the first attempts to systematize and synthesize the material of considerable importance for the comprehensive image of Egyptian art.

June 1991

Joachim Śliwa

Peter Paminger, *Ägyptische Kleinkunst aus der Sammlung Gustav Memminger*, Wiesbaden 1991, pp. 215. ISBN 3-927068-04-7.

The absorbing collection presented in this volume exclusively consists of minor plastic art objects, dating from the New Kingdom as late as to Graeco-Roman times. The said collection has come into being in recent years as the effect of its owner's journeys to Egypt and the still increasing interest for the past of the country on the Nile. This private collection of average volume (108 objects)¹ is kept in Freudenstadt (Baden-Württemberg). The proper catalogue has been furnished with a short introduction (pp. 8–10) devoted to the history of fascination with Egypt (from Iseum and Caestius' pyramid in Rome to Mozart and Rodin). The respective chronological sections are also introduced by respective historical opening passages.

Among the objects, several groups can be distinguished that set up the profile of this collection. These are mainly amulets, several scarabs and scaraboids and seal amulets, and moreover bronze figurines, some ushebti and, in Graeco-Roman division, terracotta figurines.

¹ Part of the terracotta figurines was omitted here, as were some of the bronzes; on the other hand, two modern imitations were taken into account.

Each object is provided with exhaustive description and interpretation, and this documentation is always supported with a reliable colour photograph (photographs by Wilfried Gronwald). On the other hand, already beyond the catalogue text (pp. 158–184), there are additional references for particular problems connected with respective historical periods, groups of objects and their significance, also with the specification of analogous objects. The whole closes with the list of abbreviations, list of extensive bibliography, index of proper names, drawings of inscriptions, chronological tables and the two maps.

This catalogue makes a model, competent description, which can stand as an example for other private collection owners. This way unknown artefacts, many a time of considerable historical and artistic value would be easily accessible for interested scholars.

August 1991

Joachim Śliwa

Othmar Keel, Silvia Schroer, *Studien zu den Stempelsiegeln aus Palästina/Israel*, Band I [Orbis Biblicus et Orientalis, Vol. 67], Universitätsverlag Freiburg Schweiz, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht Göttingen 1985, pp. 115. ISBN 3-7278-0336 (Universitätsverlag) and 3-525-53690-9 (Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht)

Othmar Keel, Hildi Keel-Leu, Silvia Schroer, *Studien zu den Stempelsiegeln aus Palästina/Israel*, Band II [Orbis Biblicus et Orientalis, Vol. 88], Universitätsverlag Freiburg Schweiz, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht Göttingen 1989, pp. 349. ISBN 3-7278-0629-X (Universitätsverlag) and 3-525-53718-2 (Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht). Price SFr. 44,-

Othmar Keel, Menakhem Shuval, Christoph Uehlinger, *Studien zu den Stempelsiegeln aus Palästina/Israel*, Band III [Orbis Biblicus et Orientalis, Vol. 100], Universitätsverlag Freiburg Schweiz, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht Göttingen 1990, pp. 455. pls. XXII. ISBN 3-7278-0692-3 (Universitätsverlag) and 3-525-53732-8 (Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht.) Price SFr. 120,—

The three volumes of *Studies* discussed below contain important and rich material accumulated in the course of the realization of the project "Sammlung und Auswertung der in Palästina/Israel bei regulären Grabungen gefundenen Stempelsiegel als Elemente einer palästinisch/israelitischen Religionsgeschichte" from 1981 onwards. Professor Othmar Keel (Biblical Institute of the University Freiburg Schweiz), the director and initiator of the project, is also the author of the introductory treatise entitled "Bildträger aus Palästina/Israel und die besondere Bedeutung der Miniaturkunst", Vol. I, pp. 7–47, in which he discusses the place and role of seals and scarabs decoration within the said territory, seals' significance as being the conveyor of ideas and information, and the state of research on the entire subject matter.

From among the materials of the *Corpus* of finds, made up in recent years, a series of other problems have been scientifically described, both as iconographical studies and descriptions of topical groups or workshop assemblage from the Neolithic to the Iron Age.

Of great significance are the studies, based on glyptics, on mutual cultural interaction in this region (cf. O. Keel, "Zur Identifikation des Falkenköpfigen auf den Skarabäen der ausgehenden 13. und der 15. Dynastie", Vol. II, pp. 243—277 and S. Schroer, "Die Göttin auf den Stempelsiegeln aus Palästina/Israel", Vol. II, pp. 89—207). On the other hand, the representations of Ptah have served to stimulate investigation of the relation between miniature seal representations and monumental art, with many valuable methodological observations following (O. Keel, "Der ägyptische Gott Ptah auf Siegelamuletten aus Palästina/Israel. Einige Gesetzmässigkeiten bei der Übernahme von Motiven der Grosskunst auf Miniaturbildträger", Vol. II, pp. 281—323). I would also like to mention an important work by M. Shuval, ("A Catalogue of Early Iron Stamp Seals from Israel", Vol. III, pp. 67—161 and 280—297), containing the treatise and interpretation of several iconographical groups (e.g. representations of gods standing on animals, the motifs of scorpion, "Sacred Tree" or the Lyre Player), and a significant work by O. Keel, ("Der Bogen als Herrschaftssymbol", Vol. III, pp. 27—65 and 263—274), of importance for the Egyptian and Old Testament iconographies. C. Uehlinger's contribution on Amun's temple erected by Ramses III in Gaza and the problem of some scarabs from Tell el-Fara South ("Der Amun-Tempel Ramses' III in P3 Knⁿ, seine südpalästinischen Tempelgütter und der Übergang von der Ägypter — zu Philisterherrschaft: ein Hinweis auf einige wenig beachtete Skarabäen", Vol. III, pp. 3—26) is characterized by very profound observations.

The idea is also to be recognized as proper of reprinting in Volume III of several studies already published earlier, which enabled them to have been provided with extensive supplements, more recent literature and further parallels, thus enriching them with additional value.

At least a couple of further volumes in this series are to be expected to appear, being equally important for the studies in the field of glyptics from the area of Palestine/Israel, for the diffusion of motifs and the development of intercultural relations in the ancient Near East. Thanks to the efforts by Professor Keel and his team, the ideas conveyed by means of tiny decorative fields have been deciphered anew and can be included into our system of comprehension of ancient Near East's civilization.

August 1991

Joachim Śliwa

Das antike Rom und der Osten. Festschrift für Klaus Parlasca zum 65. Geburtstag. Herausgegeben von Christoph Börker und Michael Donderer (Erlanger Forschungen. Reihe A. Geisteswissenschaften, Band 56). Erlangen 1990, pp. 237, pls. 41. ISBN 3-922-135-69-2. Price: DM 120,—

Professor Klaus Parlasca's 65th anniversary has been commemorated, in a manner prevailing mainly in German scientific circles, with a special volume. The celebrated, in 1971—1990 a full professor of classical archaeology at Friedrich-Alexander Universität in Erlangen wrote 8 books and 110 papers. In the course of his enormous scientific activity he has embraced such problems as Graeco-Roman Egypt, Syrian and Palmyrenian art, Roman provincial art, Roman mosaics and the reception of ancient civilization in European art and culture. Professor Parlasca has also earned the reputation in such periodicals as "*Bibliotheca Orientalis*", "*Gnomon*", or "*Orientalistische Literaturzeitung*" of an extremely profound reviewer, whose critical remarks have always introduced new and important elements to the subject matter touched upon in the publications reviewed (more than 80 of his reviews appeared in print).

The volume opens with the bibliography of Professor Parlasca (pp. XI—XXIX), listed in a very clear and precise way — not only chronologically but in conformity with the problems covered by and with the importance of the publications. These latter are divided into books, articles, treatises, and finally into other works and reviews. All these publications are provided with simple letter symbols and numeration, which enable their being specified and indexed on merely two pages, according to the problems distinguished in Prof. Parlasca's scholarly activity (pp. XXVIII—XXIX). This way of arranging individual scholars' bibliographies undoubtedly deserves wider propagation, and has more advantages than the plain listing of works in chronological order. This idea conceived in minds of the editors of the book under consideration is sure to be followed in similar undertakings.

Further part of the said work contains, alphabetically, the names of the authors of 13 works (articles belong to Professor's closest circle — his friends, disciples and colleagues: archaeologists, historians of ancient world and classical philologists).

There are the following works among the studies in classical archaeology: Christoph Börker (Erlangen), *Forum und Kapitulum von Korinth. Zur Planung einer römischen Kolonie in Griechenland*, pp. 1—18 [the author investigates Roman and Italic influence on the architecture of the Greek world in the late hellenistic and imperial periods, basing on the architecture of Corinth]; Michael Donderer (Erlangen), *Das pompejanische Alexandermosaik — Ein östliches Importstück?*, pp. 19—31 [the author suggests that the famous mosaic of Alexander from *Casa del Fauno* in Pompeii had once adorned a hall in some palace in the eastern Mediterranean and reached Italy (trade, booty?) divided into segments, having been reassembled in Pompeii]; Günter Grimm (Trier), *Paulina und Antinous. Zur Vergöttlichung der Hadrianschwester in Ägypten*, pp. 33—34 [on iconography of Domitia Paulina, Hadrian's sister, with the attributes of Isis-Selene. She traveled with her brother to Egypt, and died in Alexandria in 130 A.D.]; Peter Kranz (Bochum), *Zeugnisse hadrianischer Religionspolitik im Osten*, pp. 125—141 [an important essay on emperor's cult in Rome and in the eastern Empire (Olympios, Panhellenios, Synnaos); remarks on the typology and frequency of the images of Asklepios]; Ingemar Parlasca (Frankfurt am Main), *Seltene Typen nabatäischer Ter-*

rakotten. Östliche Motive in der späteren Provincia Arabia, pp. 157—174 [an important contribution to the studies on the typology of Petra terracotta ware from the Early Empire]; Robert Werner (Gauting), Der Ursprung Roms in seinen eurasischen und orientalischen Beziehungen, pp. 195—218 [considerations using annalistics, archaeology, linguistics and history of religion (among others, pertaining to the she-wolf myth, the rape of the Sabines, Luperi and Salii, against an extensive comparative background)].

It only remains to list subsequent texts included in the „Festschrift” volume under discussion: Joachim Gruber (Erlangen), ... per Alpium iuga in hispitalem et Caucasum. Eine Beobachtung zur ersten Epode des Horaz, pp. 45—51; Hans Klees (Erlangen), Griechisches und Römisches in der Traumdeutung Artemidors für Herren und Sklaven, pp. 53—76; Richard Klein (Wendelstein), Das Kirchenbauverständnis Constantins d.Gr. in Rom und in den östlichen Provinzen, pp. 77—101; Severin Köster (Erlangen), Cum Gallus amore peribat. Der Tod des praefectus Aegypti im Spiegel der 10. Ekloge, pp. 103—116; Andreas Mehl (Erlangen), Zu den diplomatischen Beziehungen zwischen Antiochos III und Rom, 200—193 v.Chr., pp. 143—155; Egert Pöhlmann (Erlangen), Zur Rezeption der hellenistischen Komödie in Rom, pp. 175—193; Henning Wrede (Köln), Römische Reliefs griechischer Meister? Zur Antikenrezeption in der Renaissance, pp. 219—234.

For Professor Parlasca, celebrating his anniversary, a gift of suchlike commemorative volume, containing the works on Rome's relations with the Orient¹, undoubtedly makes the most precious expression of friendship and links with the milieu with which he has been connected in the course of the last two decades.

June 1991

Joachim Śliwa

¹ Is its title to be regarded as a paraphrase of or reference to the problem question once raised by J. Strzygowski, „Orient oder Rom?”.

Volkmar Fritz, *Kleines Lexikon der Biblischen Archäologie* (Bibel-Kirche-Gemeinde, Band 26), Christliche Verlagsanstalt Konstanz 1987, pp. 202. ISBN 3-7673-7626-1.

This small, handy book published in renowned popular series *Bibel-Kirche-Geschichte*, contains basic information on the most important problems of the archaeology of the Bible land. Geographically, it covers both Israel and Jordan, and particular entries pertain to archaeological sites, peoples and tribes inhabiting Palestine, and to the elements of the ancient architecture and art. The discussion of realities makes an important part, with pottery and its leading forms focused upon alongside raw materials and other materials used in the artistic handicraft.

All entries are presented in a clear and concise way, with principal features brought into prominence, and are provided with basic bibliography of the

subject. Apart from numerous drawings accompanying particular entries, the publication is also furnished with a set of good colour photographs, grouped on 16 plates.

It seems that the author has put particular emphasis on the description of archaeological sites presented in the booklet. In each case, such things are taken into account as history of excavations, development of settlements, most important architectural structures, or basic construction traits. The entries are accompanied by drawings and plans, with rudimentary bibliography given.

Having in view popular character of this lexicon, its closing pages contain (pp. 194—200) an appendix with the list of Egyptian dynasties (after E. Hornung), of the kings of Israel and Judah (after E. Jepsen); moreover, a list of weights and measures and finally, a vocabulary of more difficult notions. On the other hand, the introduction (pp. 7—14 contains a concise outline of Palestine's civilization together with a chronological table (from Neolithic to Roman times) and the map of the sites.

The publication under review can be of considerable assistance for those interested in the Old Testament studies, as well as makes an introductory manual for seminarists, archaeology and history students and the so called interested laymen. The Polish book market is really in want of such lexicon.

June 1991

Joachim Śliwa

Dymitr Ibriszimow, *Towards a Common Chadic Lexicon* [= *Zeszyty Naukowe Uniwersytetu Jagiellońskiego CMLXXXVIII Prace Językoznawcze. Zeszyt CII / Prolegomena ad linguarum Chadicarum lexicon commune = Universitatis Iagellonicae Acta Scientiarum Literarumque CMLXXXVIII Schedae grammaticae. Fasciculus CII*], Cracow 1989/90, ISBN 83-233-0371-1, 122 pp. 1 chart.

In his Ph. D. thesis (advised and supported by Andrzej Czapkiewicz, Stanisław Piłaszewicz, Herrmann Jugraithmayr and others) Ibriszimow mainly aims "to present some tentative Chadic cognates elicited on the basis of comparing basic Chadic lexical items for which material from a representative number of languages is available". Ibriszimow's study "is also to find out the common Chadic form for each item; and to arrange the matching consonants of these forms in consonant resemblance series". (p. 33)

In this behalf the author surveys in his first chapter the history of the concept of and research in the Chadic language family vis à vis the other branches of the Afroasiatic group — he uses the term *family* — of languages, and concludes that regarding "the presented general Chadic lexical comparisons, their aims and results, it may be stated that, while the assertions" adduced "may be stated to <have> be<en> at least hypothetical" on several grounds, "three undoubted facts have emerged": (1) the Chadic languages are to be grouped in one family unit; (2) cognate items are attested for all Chadic languages; (3) likewise, "the existence of imperfect sound laws" must be noted.

(p. 19) Consequently, Ibrizimow presents and discusses these in consideration of views previously offered in his chapter 2. (pp. 21—31)

After aforesaid and further clarification regarding the aims and method of his work as well as its terminology, inasmuch as an agreement in basic vocabulary should be sought above all in both respects, the semantic and the phonetic (pp. 33—38), Ibrizimow offers in chapter 4 (pp. 39—43) lists of the languages and language sub-families of his concern. In chapter 5 (pp. 47—107) containing the main body of his thesis, he then examines Chadic representations of words supposedly basic to any language, such as "head", "hair", "body", "limb", and "mud". While he marks variations not only for basic roots, but also in respect to phonetics and morphology, one will have to examine the interrelations of words within commonly used sub-families more closely. Moreover, some of the words offered by Ibrizimow may not have originated within the Chadic family, even though sub-families show the same or cognate forms thereof. See, e.g., samples listed for "scorpion" (pp. 100—103), such as Matakam *varadza*, Gisiga *'arats*, Mofu-Gudur *arac*, Laamang *irda*, Mandara *irdza*, Glavda *ardza*, Dghwede *ranza*, Gava *rinza*.

Ibrizimow has been aware of the hypothetic character of some of his samples (though not of the item "scorpion"), and one may question whether his assumption in the course of his "Summary of the Results" (= chapter 6 on pp. 109—112) is solidly founded, i.e., that "the hypothetical items" might be "the most valuable from the diachronic point of view" and that "those lexematic items which" he rightly "combined in groups, i.e. 'tooth', 'bone', and 'egg'; 'sun', 'fire' and 'ashes'" may be considered merely as "also very useful" [my emphasis]. I suggest that it is these which make Ibrizimow's study a useful and valuable step and contribution towards further synchronic and then diachronic investigations, any synchronic investigation to be carried out, as Ibrizimow points out in his chapter 7, in formal and semantic directions, yet not only through phonetic and comparing research and evaluation, but also in consideration of general and special morphology and syntax, as these are the main criteria to pinpoint linguistic interrelations.

Bruno W. W. Dombrowski

Andrzej Czapkiewicz, *The Views of the Medieval Arab Philologists on Language and its Origin in the Light of 'as-Suyūṭī's 'al-Muḏhir*" [= Zeszyty Naukowe Uniwersytetu Jagiellońskiego CMIX, Prace Językoznawcze. Zeszyt 96/ Philologi Arabici Medii Aevi de lingua eiusque origine quid existimaverint ex opere sub titulo "'al-Muḏhir" ab 'as-Suyūṭī conscripto quaeritur = Universitas Iagellonica Acta Scientiarum Litterarumque CMIX, Schedae Grammaticae Fasc. XCVI], Cracow 1988, 141 pp. (ISBN 83-233-0266-9).

With sadness, I am to review post mortem a distinguished scholar's last book.¹ It is Andrzej Czapkiewicz' monograph on Mediaeval Arabic materials

and learned men, Arabs and other, important for the historiography of general linguistics.

Among the considerable number of works on the Arabic language and linguists 'Abū'l-Faḍl 'Abd 'ar-Rahmān ben 'Abī Bakr ben Muḥammad ben 'Abī Bakr Ḡalāl 'ad-Dīn 'as-Suyūṭī 'al-Ḥuḍayrī 'aš-Šāfi'ī (H 849-911 = A.D. 1445—1505)² compiled there are four of particular value for Czapkiewicz' purpose. *Buḡyat 'al-wu'āt tabaqāt 'al-luḡawīyīn wan-nuḥāt* is important as a source for biographic materials on grammarians, 'Arabs and others, concerned with the Arabic language, its dialects, alien impact thereon and the like.³ In *'al-Ašbāḥ wa-n-na-zā'ir 'an-naḥwīya*⁴ 'as-Suyūṭī gathered and compared points of grammar, raised by former grammarians, in accordance with the principles of works on law named likewise,⁵ while in *'al-Iqtirāḥ fī 'ilm 'usūl 'an-naḥw* the significance of grammatical criteria is discussed. In particular, this book frequently cites authors of lost works.⁶ Last but not least, 'as-Suyūṭī has become known for his *'al-Muḏhir fī 'ulūm 'al-luḡa wa-'anwā'ihā* (prints: Bulaq H 1282 = A.D. 1865/66, Cairo H 1325 = A.D. 1907/08⁷) which we would probably render nowadays in a somewhat modernised fashion by "Introduction⁸ to the science of language and its forms". This work edited in two volumes by Muḥammad 'Aḥmad Ḡādd 'al-Mawlā, 'Alī Muḥammad 'al-Baḡāwī, and Muḥammad 'Abū 'l-Faḍl 'Ibrāhīm (Cairo 1942, 1945⁹) Czapkiewicz chose for his treatise being aware of the fact that works such as 'Ibn Manzūr's [+ H 713 = A.D. 1311] *Lisān 'al-'arab* and Suyūṭī's *'al-Muḏhir* offer valuable information on both the Arabic language with its older dialects and the views of writers, especially, linguists (by the standards of their times). However, since due to said character of Suyūṭī's works as compilatory, being not unusual for his contemporaries, they were "not always acknowledging the authorship of their original authors, it is in many cases thanks to him (Suyūṭī) that we have acquired the knowledge of the existence of many lost works and of the precious material included in them." (p. 10).¹⁰

Consequently, Czapkiewicz organised his study by proffering on pp. 9—11 an introduction and assessment of 'as-Suyūṭī and his work, then he listed on pp. 13—24 what he could make out of the contributors to the contents of 'as-Suyūṭī's *'al-Muḏhir* and their personal data with references mainly to GAL I and II. Thereafter, on pp. 25—39, he presents a summary of views of Arab¹¹ medieval scholars on language and its origins, yet tries to abstain — with notable success — from any critique involved in the application of modern linguistics (cf his preface on p. 7). Finally, he offers on pp. 43—93 a translation of sections of *'al-Muḏhir* relevant for his investigation (with annotation on pp. 95—104) and on pp. 107—141 their Arabic base.

As a matter of course, Czapkiewicz' chapter regarding the views of medieval scholars on Arabic and other languages, their origin(s) and developments deserve special interest. It will suffice in this context, though, to check how Czapkiewicz approached this major task of his book. Thence the reader is referred to the informative treatise itself.

Czapkiewicz opens with the remark that this would be a "short summary of the contents of the text included in this (his) book..." and "the purpose of this

chapter is then to give the reader an idea of problems dealt with", and he continues: "The linguistic speculations of the Arab medieval scholars, though reflecting their idea of language in general, are mostly illustrated with the examples from the Arabic language and most often refer immediately to it, but this is the result of the fact that the majority of those scholars considered Arabic the first language which had appeared in the world".

Going into details the author then deals with the topic "the emergence of language and the appearance of the parts of speech" pointing to the two principal kinds of view and their proponents, i.e., that language was wholly created by god and revealed to Adam and passed on by the latter to mankind and, on the other hand, that language was the result of a kind of *contrat social*. These positions were not only affirmed by contemplation, reasoning and philosophical and theological speculation but also altered and compromised in various ways. Some, among them 'as-Suyūṭī, accepted several or all alternatives of possible origins of language. "It is worth noticing", so Czapkiewicz continues, "that the adherence to any of the exposed standpoints had a great impact on the views of their promoters on other aspects of language." (p. 26) The adherents to the view of divine and human cooperation in the creation of language maintained *vs* "the creationists" interpretation that the passage "all the names" in Koran II: 30 meant the Angels or rational beings only and not everything, or if yet all nouns, then not the verbs and particles. They had their origins in human effort.

Another matter of interest and dispute were the time of origin of language and the dating of languages other than Arabic, some of "the creationists" advocating the beginning of time and that only one language, viz. Arabic, was concerned, other languages were also revealed but only thereafter, so to the descendents of Noah, whereas other learned men suggested that all languages were created (approximately) simultaneously thereby concurring with those assuming divine and human cooperation. Still others, however, i.e., those explaining the origin of language as a result of human effort and consent, refused to set any date therefor. According to their idea it was achieved by "an assembly of people, e.g. of the Arabs, <which>, after having gathered, was pointing collectively to different objects uttering at the same time unanimously different sets of sounds and connected in this way theses sounds with the respective objects pointed to, so that, later on, when a given set of sounds was heard, it was referred to the object with which it had been connected. This led to the emergence of the nominal category in Arabic. In the same way" the other categories of words were formed in Arabic and other languages. (pp. 27 f.)

There is much more which Czapkiewicz has brought to light concentrating on the materials before him for reconstruction of medieval linguists' thoughts on the origins and further developments of Arabic, seen by many of them as the language *par excellence*, and other languages. The wealth of detailed thought of mediaeval scholars, Arab and non-Arab, becomes again tangible through Czapkiewicz' work gathered in a lucid presentation. With respect and gratitude Andrzej Czapkiewicz' bequest is recommended for reading not only to Arabists and other linguists but to everyone interested in the history of human thought as well.

NOTES:

¹ For the life and work of the late Professor Andrzej Czapkiewicz see the obituary by E. Górska, J. Bubka and A. Kmietowicz in *Folia Orientalia* 28 = *Studies in Memory of Andrzej Czapkiewicz* 1 <1991> pp. 5—12 with photograph preceding.

² Born in Asyut, 'as-Suyūṭī also wrote a history of his home-town with the title 'al-Madbut fi ta'Madbut ta'rih 'as-Si/uyūt: see W. Ahlwardt, *Verzeichnis der arabischen Handschriften der Königlichen Bibliothek zu Berlin* 10 vols, Berlin 1887—99, no. 9845 (57). (Missing in C. Brockelmann, *Geschichte der arabischen Literatur*, 2nd ed., Leiden 1937—49, [= GAL and GAL Suppl], but again referred to in *Grundriss der arabischen Philologie* [= GARPh] vol. II ed. by H. Gätje, Wiesbaden 1987, p. 280). For more on 'as-Suyūṭī's descent, his life and works see Czapkiewicz pp. 9 f., F. Sezgin, *Geschichte des arabischen Schrifttums* [= Sezgin] vols. IX <Leiden 1984> (pp. 22, 26) and VIII, *ibid.* 1982 (p. 19), C. Brockelmann, "Al Suyūṭī" [in:] *The Encyclopaedia of Islam*, Leiden 1913—38, vol. 4, pp. 573—75.

³ See Sezgin IX p. 22: no. 44b, VIII p. 19: no. 27.

⁴ Sezgin IX p. 26: no. 4.

⁵ Sezgin *ibid.*, GARPh II p. 164.

⁶ Sezgin IX p. 26: no. 5, GARPh II p. 164.

⁷ Sezgin IX p. 22: no. 45; for manuscripts see GAL II 155, GAL Suppl II 194.

⁸ „Die umfangreichste *Isagogik* in die arabische Sprachwissenschaft" (Sezgin IX p. 26: no. 6; the emphasis is mine). 'as-Suyūṭī was „der bedeutendste jüngste uns bekannte Vertreter" of the *Isagogik* (Sezgin VIII p. 15).

⁹ So Sezgin IX p. 22: no. 45 after H. Ritter. Neither appears to have been available to Czapkiewicz (cf. his p. 24 n. ****) who has „some time around 1970".

¹⁰ For an indication of the contents, as far as preserved, of the major parts of 'al-Muzhir which one misses in Czapkiewicz' book the reader is referred to M. A. Gadd 'al-Mawla's et al. edition. See also Sezgin IX p. 23, VIII p. 19: no. 28.

¹¹ This is not quite correct, since a considerable number of the grammarians and linguists, if not their majority, was of parentage other than genuinely Arabic.

Bruno W. W. Dombrowski

Dorota Rudnicka-Kassem, *Egyptian Drama and Social Change: a Study of Thematic and Artistic Development in Yūsuf Idrīs's Plays*, Cracow-Montreal The Enigma Press, 1993, 200 pages.

The historiographical study of Dorota Rudnicka-Kassem aims to present a synthesized approach to the creativity of Yūsuf Idrīs (1927—1991), one of the best Egyptian (Arab) playwrights. While elaborating on the biography of Idrīs, the author discusses his literary works beginning with the earliest, which have Western influence, to the latest more mature, refined and of a unique Egyptian (Arab) character.

In Idrīs's fiction and drama both, realism seems to be a dominant trend. This realism perfectly depicts the Egyptian (Arab) world of reality, sketches lively heroes, namely, ordinary Arab (Egyptian) people with all their everyday struggles and problems. Politics always inspired Idrīs and there is no doubt that his literary works and especially plays were created out of his political reflections and experiences. These plays deal with basic Egyptian (Arab) concerns such as, lack of political equilibrium, desire for freedom, equality and justice.

The study by Rudnicka-Kassem illustrates how simple Idrīs's realism underwent an interesting and creative evolution, and absorbed the best features of new literary trends and movements including neo-realism, surrealism, symbolism, expressionism and science fiction.

The two hundred page study consists of four chapters, a short introduction, conclusion and bibliography.

The first chapter "Yūsuf Idrīs, his life and work" (pp. 13—54) sketches with precision the personality of Idrīs underlying the most important factors which may possibly influence the playwright. Our attention focuses here on the section „Creative influences and artistic personality" which contains an interesting selection of Idrīs's remarks on the role and function of a writer in contemporary society as well as on the question of Arab identity, Arab cultural heritage and on art and artistic movements. I believe this selection had helped Rudnicka-Kassem to sketch the personality of Idrīs precisely, vividly and objectively. Her description of Idrīs precisely, vividly and objectively. Her description of Idrīs convincingly presents him as a writer engaged in constant search of new themes, new artistic forms and secret of true art. The last section of this chapter presents us with a brief review of Idrīs's fiction. Apart from other, already known works, Rudnicka-Kassem also discusses stories from the collection *Aṭḥ 'alā al-Nazar* (1987) and novel *Niyū Yūrḳ* (1980) which up until now remain unnoticed by literary critics.

The second chapter "Early experiments with drama" (pp. 55—106) forms the main argument of the study. Rudnicka-Kassem's task in this study is to illustrate convincingly that Idrīs's plays are the reflection of post-1952 Egyptian (Arab) political, social and cultural realities. As for the method she has chosen it is the chronological presentation of the plays with the focus on their thematic and artistic evolution in the light of post-1952 Egyptian (Arab) political, social and cultural problems. Rudnicka-Kassem's discussion of the first three plays of Idrīs, that is, *Malik al-Quṭn* (1957), *Jumhūriyyat Farahāt* (1957) and *al-Laḥza al-Ḥarija* (1958) exposes clearly a smooth transition of Idrīs's drama form from the simple structured short (dramatized) story through to one-act precisely worded plays into a fulllength three-act dramatic structure.

The third chapter „Search for identity" (pp. 107—153) deals with the plays written in the sixties, namely, *al-Fārāfir* (1964), *al-Mahzala al-Arḍiyya* (1966) and *al-Mukhaṭṭaṭīn* (1969). Rudnicka-Kassem's analysis exposes her new approach to the play, i.e. a new attempt to read its inner meaning. Her views on Western and Eastern influences on the play differ from those of other critics. She does not see the necessity of measuring the balance of both influences. Instead, she looks closely at role of Farfūr in Idrīs's theatre and sides with Idrīs saying that despite some visible affinities with Harlequin, Farfūr is a unique Egyptian (Arab) character who has grown up with Egyptian (Arab) people and is a lively embodiment of all their feelings, frustrations and pains. While reading the third chapter we will also focus on the play *al-Mukhaṭṭaṭīn* and Rudnicka-Kassem's remarks concerning Idrīs's model of hero-leader.

The fourth chapter „Between fantasy and reality" (pp. 155—187) contains the analysis of Idrīs's two last plays, that is, *al-Jins al-Thālith* (1971) and *al-Bahlawān* (1982). Rudnicka-Kassem's original and new interpretation of the content and symbols of the play *al-Jins al-Thālith* deserves our attention. As for the play *al-Bahlawān*, which has not been discussed yet, here Rudnicka-Kassem while discussing its content and form attempts to find an answer for a question: Why did Idrīs call that play his best achievement in drama. Furthermore, she points out once again the playwright's preoccupation with picturing ordinary, simple people who despite many difficulties and obstacles, which they have to face in their everyday lives, are capable of retaining their honesty and dignity.

The study closes with a concise conclusion. Rudnicka-Kassem summarizes chronologically the basic thematic and formal changes which have occurred in Idrīs's plays during the time span of over a quarter of a century and points out their political, social and cultural context.

While discussing the study we have to underline the fact that this is the first available critico-literary work on all Idrīs's plays. The author has convincingly argued her thesis, presenting that plays of Idrīs are in their content and form subjected and influenced by the post-1952 Egyptian (Arab) realities.

The work also contains a review of critical material on Idrīs's drama which has been published in Arabic, English, French, Russian and Polish. Furthermore, the author argues with statements of the critics.

An additional value to the study is the author's introduction into her discussion the journalistic works of Idrīs. This part of Idrīs literary creativity has not been yet analysed by the scholars. It might be possible that knowledge of Idrīs's journalism has helped Rudnicka-Kassem to read the inner meaning of his plays and find original clues.

The study presented by Rudnicka-Kassem it is a sound contribution to the literary studies on the activities and works of Yūsuf Idrīs, a well known Egyptian (Arab) author whose achievements are of great significance in the modern development of Arabic literature.

Cracow, June 19th 1993

Maria Kowalska

Róbert Simon, *Meccan Trade and Islam. Problems of origin and structure*. Budapest 1989, Akadémiai Kiadó. 206 pp. [Bibliotheca Orientalis Hungarica, vol. XXXII, ed. by Lajos Ligeti].

The book here discussed is the revised and supplemented English translation of "A mekkai kereskedelem kialakulása és jellege", edited by the same publisher. Róbert Simon, an eminent authority on economic and social history of pre- and early Islamic society in North Arabia, gives a complete analysis of the data and properly chosen sources relating to the presented problems. The author draws the reader's attention to the study of the origin of long-distance Meccan trade acting on the basis of traditional tribal society, for, in his

opinion, the role played by this trade in the genesis of Islām and Arabian historical movements was of great importance. As to the method of research, R. Simon decides to use the Arabic sources as well as others (i.e. South Arabic, Byzantine, Syrian, Abyssinian) and focuses on the hitherto neglected Arab historical traditions.

Different factors considered worthy of further investigation are studied in the work, but it would seem that the most interesting part of the research is a manifold analysis of the external and internal conditions of Meccan trade. The external conditions concern the variety of contacts of the North Arabian society with its neighbours, therefore one finds here, a description of Oriental trade in the 6th century and the respective markets involved, as well as the relation of the minor states (among others, Abyssinia, Yemen, the Ghassānids and Lakhmids) with the great powers, i.e. the Byzantine Empire and Sassanian Iran. The presentation of the diachronic process allows one to observe the very complicated network of interdependences between the individual phenomena and societies with their developments and declines.

The chapter dealing with the internal conditions of Meccan trade acquaints the reader with such specific features as the institutions of "ḥums" and "īlāf". Before "ḥums" and "īlāf" it were characterized primarily by barter trade among the tribes and occasionally concerned a pilgrimage. In the light of these facts the existence of Mecca as a city is contested by R. Simon. "Ḥums" was a means for the creation of religious unity among the Quraysh and the tribes cooperating with them, not only for the period of the pilgrimage, but for the whole year. "Ḥums" was both the cause and consequence of the permanent settlement that preceded "īlāf", the next step in the development of Meccan trade.

Since the fragments of the Koran and the other sources on which the author bases his description of "īlāf" — determining this institution as a kind of conclusion of agreements with the rulers and chiefs of the tribes living along the trade route in order to ensure free passage through their territories — show us all its circumstances, we can support Simon's thesis that it was shaped as the result of an enduring process.

Another great merit of the study is a detailed explanation of problems such as the internal organization of Meccan trade, transacted peacefully, the external factors determining trade of Mecca with respect of its role in Ḥijāz, (a type of local market on the Arabian peninsula on the eve of Islam) and the nature of Meccan trade itself, which, according to the author, represented the most important and mobile economic force of that time.

The book is supplemented by three appendixes discussing respectively the relation between Meccan trade and Muhammadan Islām, comments on the conditions of ownership of Muhammadan Islām and observations of the institution of "mu'ākhāh" (fraternization).

In summary, it is perhaps no exaggeration to say that one receives an admirable study, thanks to a proper method of investigation and the interesting presentation of the discussed problems. I hope the next achievements of R. Simon will be published soon.

Andrzej Bartczak

Lars Johanson: *Linguistische Beiträge zur Gesamturkologie* (= Bibliotheca Orientalis Hungarica XXXVII, hrsg. von Gy. Hazai), Budapest 1991, Akadémiai Kiadó, VIII+250 S., 8°.

Mit dem neuen Band der *Bibliotheca Orientalis Hungarica* bekommt jetzt der Leser nicht eine neue Monographie, sondern einen Sammelband von Reprints von L. Johanson in die Hand, und zwar einen mit insgesamt elf Artikeln aus den Jahren 1974—1986, die unterschiedlichen Fragen der Laut-, Formen- und Satzlehre der Türkischen Sprachen gewidmet sind. Den Band schließt ein Schriftenverzeichnis des Verfassers.

Ein Sammelband bietet natürlich immer nur eine Auswahl von Aufsätzen und diese kann selbstverständlich nach verschiedenen Kriterien getroffen werden. Mit dem vorliegenden Buch wurden verschiedene Interessenkreise des Verfassers gezeigt. Es wäre allerdings nicht weniger interessant, einen Sammelband von allen zusammenhängenden Reprints (samt denen von Rezensionen) zu einem ausgewählten Thema zu haben. So findet hier der Leser z. B. zwei Artikel zum Suffixvokalismus neugedruckt vor, doch der im Schriftenverzeichnis genannte Artikel Nr. 41 ("Nejtral'naja stadija v razvitii affiksalnogo vokalizma v tureckom i azerbajdzanskom jazykax") fehlt im Band. Neben der Studie zu mittelostmanischen Transkriptionstexten möchte man gerne auch den Artikel Nr. 69 ("Die mittelostmanischen Transkriptionstexte der Universitätsbibliothek Uppsala") haben.

Die Studien des Verfassers zu Sprachkontakten sind im Buch so gut wie nicht repräsentiert; im Schriftenverzeichnis finden sich dagegen zwei Aufsätze (Nr. 74, 81), die die hier gebotene Auswahl hätten wesentlich bereichern können.

Weil man aber mit keiner Auswahl alle Leser völlig zufriedenstellen kann, soll das Gesagte in erster Linie als ein Vorschlag für die Zukunft betrachtet werden. Schon jetzt kann sich dagegen jeder linguistisch interessierte Turkologe über das Zugänglichwerden der bisher verstreuten Artikel freuen.

Stanisław Stachowski

András Róna-Tas: *An Introduction to Turkology* (= Studia Uralo-Altaica 33; ed. Klára Szőnyi-Sándor), Szeged 1991, 170 S.

Wer erst mit dem Turkologiestudium anfängt, der ist sich zumeist auch nicht im geringsten darüber klar, wie umfangreich und differenziert dieses Forschungsfeld ist. Die neulich erschienene Einführung in die Turkologie von dem wohl bekannten Linguisten, Prof. András Róna-Tas führt diesen Umstand noch einmal deutlich vor Augen. Mit dem Erscheinen dieser Einführung werden die bisher veröffentlichten Werke ähnlichen Charakters nämlich nicht überholt, sondern auf eine glückliche Weise ergänzt.

Bei der "Introduction" handelt es sich um den ersten Band von einem als

dreibändig geplanten Werk. Hierzu schreibt der Verf. selbst: "This volume is only the first of a series but does not bear this numeral because I am in this respect superstitious. The second volume is practically ready. (...) Thus volumes I and II will offer a kind of graphematic and orthographic analysis of Old Turkic. In Volume III all loan-words from Old Turkic into non Turkic languages will be dealt with." (S. 3). Wer an unterschiedlichen Schreibsystemen und den damit verbundenen graphematischen Fragen interessiert war, der konnte in den früher veröffentlichten Einführungswerken tatsächlich nur einzelne Informationen, doch keine umfangreichere und kohärente Darstellung finden. Dies geschieht nun zum ersten Mal und in diesem Sinne wurde die "Introduction" eingangs als eine glückliche Ergänzung charakterisiert.

Der ganze Band besteht aus zwei Hauptteilen: "General Introduction" (S. 7—51) und "Introduction to the Study of the Old Turkic Languages in Different Scripts" (S. 53—110). Im ersteren werden folgende Fragenkomplexe kurz dargestellt: Verwandtschaftsproblem der tü. Sprachfamilie; Periodisierung der tü. Sprachgeschichte; Klassifizierung der Türksprachen; kurze Geschichte der Türkvölker; die Mongolen; die Mandschu-Tungusen; Religionen. Im zweiten Hauptteil werden dagegen Quellen in runischer, in Brāhmī- und in tibetanischer Schrift präsentiert.

Diesen zwei Hauptteilen folgt nun ein umfangreicher Ergänzungsteil, zu dem gehören: sieben Schrifttabellen (S. 111—117), das Literaturverzeichnis (S. 118—128) und fünf Anhänge (S. 129—170).

Es sei hier besonders die Ausgewogenheit mancher Formulierung zu strittigen Fragen der Altaistik (so S. 16f. zur uralt. Sprachverwandtschaft) betont, sowie die Tatsache, daß in der Bibliographie auch die Einführungen der Vertreter der genetischen Urverwandtschaft, Prof. N. Poppe und Prof. K. H. Menges genannt werden [zur Persönlichkeit und dem Schaffen des 1991 verstorbenen Prof. Poppe s. jetzt auch: Miller, Roy Andrew: Obituary. Nikolaj Nikolaevič Poppe (8 August 1987—8 June 1991), *TULIP* 5 (1992): 2—5].

Den Kern der ganzen Arbeit bildet aber natürlich die Darstellung der Quellen und der Schreibsysteme. Und für diese Synthese können wir alle dem Verf. nur sehr dankbar sein.

Dabei soll auch die ästhetische Seite der Veröffentlichung hervorgehoben werden — abgesehen von einigen wenigen ergänzenden Bemerkungen, die ganz klein gedruckt und daher schwerer zu lesen sind (z.B. S. 63f., 86), macht die ganze Ausgabe einen guten Eindruck, und die vielen Tabellen (in den beiden Hauptteilen sowie im "Tabellenteil") sind schön übersichtlich.

Marek Stachowski

Peter B. Golden, *An Introduction to the History of the Turkic Peoples. Ethnogenesis and State-Formation in Medieval and Early Modern Eurasia and the Middle East*, Otto Harrassowitz, Wiesbaden 1992, 483 pp.

The primary objective of this recently published book is to present the ethnogenesis of the Turkic peoples, the process of their state-formation and

their linguistic development. According to the author, the process by which any one of the Turkic peoples developed is multi-layered and therefore the purpose of this work is not to give a detailed exposition of the subject but rather to provide an introduction to the question of the history of the Turkic peoples.

The subject is presented in three aspects: historical, geographical and linguistic, also showing the cultural-historical contexts and relationships between the Turkic peoples and other societies of Asia and the Middle East.

After the acknowledgements, a prefatory note on names and transcriptions and a list of maps, the introduction (pp. 1—12) gives a short illustration of the world of the steppes. Subsequently to this are the twelve chapters of the work, under the following headings: I. The Peoples and Languages of Eurasia. II. The Legacy of Inner Asia. III. Empires and Migrations: the Hsien-pi and Their Successors: the Tabḡač, Jou-Jan/Avar and Hephthalite States. IV. The Early Turkic Peoples of Western Eurasia. V. The Türk Empires of Eurasia. VI. Successors of the Türks in Inner Asia. VII. Successors of the Türks in Central Asia. VIII. The Successors of the Türks in Western Eurasia. IX. The Turkic World in the Činggisid Era. X. Timur, the Later Činggisids and the Last Turkic Empires of Eurasia. XI. The Turkic Peoples of the Near and Middle East. XII. The Ethnogenesis of the Modern Turkic Peoples: A Brief Overview.

Chapter I (pp. 15—38) focuses in the theory of the Altaic relationship, the classification of the Turkic languages and also presents these Indo-European and Uralic languages which were historically in close contact with the Turkic. Chapter II (pp. 39—68) discusses the role of other nations of Inner Asia in the ethnogenesis of the Turkic peoples. Chapter III (pp. 69—84) present different tribal groupings in relation with the Turkic peoples. Chapter IV (pp. 85—114) sketches migratory waves of the different early Turkic peoples westward. Chapter V (pp. 115—154) gives the information on the history of the Turkic khaganates, the governance, religions, the economy and the writing system.

Chapters: VI (pp. 155—188), VII (pp. 189—232) and VIII (pp. 233—282) are devoted to the history of the successors of the Türks in Inner Asia, Central Asia, Central Asia and Western Eurasia. Chapter IX (pp. 283—308) and chapter X (pp. 309—346) deal with the history of the Mongol Empire, its state-formation and the history of different khaganates which appeared as the successors of the Chinggisids. Chapter XI (pp. 347—378) is devoted to the history of the Turkic state-formation in the Near and Middle East presented both spatially and diachronically. The last chapter, chapter XII (pp. 379—416) gives a brief overview on the ethnogenesis of the modern Turkic peoples, pointing out the important factors which took part in the process of modern nationbuilding. After the main chapters the Turkic ethnonyms, Arabic forms, Chinese characters, a bibliography and an index are given (pp. 417—483).

The reviewed book demonstrates the value of an interdisciplinary look at the ancient world. It is worth reading for its quantity and quality of historical and ethnographical data.

Ewa Siemienieć-Gołaś

Wilhelm Eilers *Die Mundart von Sīvānd*, Westiranische Mundarten aus der Sammlung Wilhelm Eilers, v. III, Franz Steiner Verlag Wiesbaden, Stuttgart 1988, pp. XX, 376, 7 photochr., 2 plans

Dans la critique du second tome des "*Dialectes iraniens occidentaux*" j'avais écrit: "Avec impatience nous attendons la suite". Le troisième volume est le dernier qui a été publié de la vie de l'auteur. Tout ce travail répondait à un projet d'énorme envergure. En rendant hommage au Disparu nous pouvons espérer que la documentation qu'il a rassemblée sera rédigée et publiée dans l'avenir.

En prenant dans les mains le troisième volume intitulé "*Dialecte de Sīvānd*" (les volumes précédents étaient consacrés aux dialectes de Chūnsār et de Gāz), le lecteur peut être persuadé qu'il est en face d'une analyse claire, qu'il y trouvera une approche détaillée du dialecte, que la structure du livre lui est connue des volumes précédents: introduction, bibliographie, introduction culturelle générale, introduction méthodologique, grammaire du dialecte, textes en transcription avec traduction, dictionnaire, glossaire des mots. Cet ordre rigoureusement suivi dans la description des dialectes iraniens occidentaux facilitera dans l'avenir les analyses comparatives.

La bibliographie se compose d'environ 150 points concernant directement le dialecte de Sīvānd, ainsi que de la dialectologie iranienne et de l'analyse de texte.

Les chapitres qui précèdent la grammaire, les textes et le vocabulaire apportent de nombreuses informations géographiques, historiques, ethnographiques et sociales sur la localité de Sīvānd. Dans les pages 30—33 ont été présentés les arguments permettant de définir ce dialecte en tant que dialecte iranien de nord-ouest, ce qui a par la suite été démontré dans les chapitres suivants. W. Eilers l'appelle "l'enclave mède, de nord-ouest — sur le territoire persan (Sīvānd est situé près de la route qui relie Persepolis à Pasargadae). Dans toute cette monographie l'auteur souligne l'influence des autres dialectes du nord-ouest ainsi que la langue persane littéraire et courante. Par exemple le préfixe duratif *mī* — (comme en persan) par rapport à *ē/-ē* et *ed-* dans les dialectes occidentaux; cependant, on constate le manque d'influence iraniennes orientales si caractéristiques pour le persan. Dans l'introduction on retrouve beaucoup d'informations quant au processus d'assemblage de la documentation, sur le témoin-informateur parlant ce dialecte, M 'Alī-Murād, sur l'origine du nom Sīvānd.

Le mérite indiscutable de ce volume ainsi que des volumes précédents des "*Dialectes iraniens occidentaux*" repose aussi dans le fait que nous sommes en présence d'un ensemble de textes divers. Comme le dit Eilers: "sans un grand nombre de propositions qui créent le contexte, il ne peut y avoir aucune dialectologie." Dans cette monographie sont présentés 37 textes différents, essentiellement des fables (pp. 139—206), accompagnés d'une traduction en allemand et de réponsants persans pour les mots et les phrases importantes.

Le vocabulaire qui accompagne ces textes contient 51 pages et apporte de nombreuses données linguistiques. Par exemple: "usūr" (p. 348) — texte n° 2,

alinéa 9,8—8,9—10 — "cheval" (pers. asp), "usūre" — 10—13 (ainsi que Lecoq, Andreas, Žukovskiy), "usū" (Mann) <*ustur<staora- (Bartholomae "Altiranisches Wörterbuch" p. 1590); viennent ensuite quelques mots composés avec le terme -usūr-. Dans le vocabulaire nous ne trouvons pas l'explication des mots qui n'appartiennent pas aux textes (p.ex. "āspā" — chien, p. 30). Sont aussi omis les verbes qui se trouvent regroupés dans le chapitre "Thèmes verbaux", pp. 110—132. On a donné le thème du présent et du passé, l'étymologie, le répondant persan (ces données sont reprise le plus souvent d'après Andreas) ainsi que les formes de conjugaison choisies.

Dans le chapitre "Grammaire du dialecte de Sīvānd" (phonétique, morphologie, éléments de syntaxe) j'ai cependant trouvé des formulations avec lesquelles il est difficile de s'accorder: p. 76: l'auteur utilise le terme "Akkusativendung" (désinence de l'Accusatif) pour un dialecte qui ne possède pas de déclinaison. D'ailleurs, d'après les exemples cités il découle que -rā/-ā n'est pas une désinence mais une postposition: "dī't-ā pādīšā-r-ām (*dī'te-e←l'izafet pādīšā-r-ām) vór-iš-gurt bérdis" — il prit la fille du roi et l'emmena (pers. doxtar-e-pādīšāh-rā-ham..), texte 10, alinéa 18. A la page 132 l'auteur en citant la formation verbum compositum renvoie au paragraphe 68 dans lequel on ne retrouve que des verbes préfixaux. Je n'ai pas non plus trouvé d'analyse des verbes composés.

Ces remarques ne diminuent cependant pas la valeur et l'importance du rôle du livre dans les études iraniennes. Le volume suivant des "*Dialectes iraniens occidentaux*" sera consacré aux dialectes de l'Anārāk et de l'oasis Chūr.

Barbara Mękarska

Solomon Isaakovič Baevskiy, *Rannyaya persidskaya leksikografiya (XI—XV v)*, Moskva, "Nauka", Glavnaya Redakciya Vostochnoy Literatury, 1989, pp. 166.

Depuis trente ans S.I. Baevskiy s'occupe de la lexicographie persane médiévale et a publié une trentaine d'ouvrages dans ce domaine. La monographie consacrée aux farhangs persans intitulée "*Lexicographie persane originale*" est d'une part une sorte de résumé des travaux antérieurs tout en tenant compte des acquis de la science mondiale dans ce domaine, et de l'autre une incitation à de nouveaux travaux qui se sont avérés possibles grâce à la découverte et à la mise à la disposition des scientifiques de nouveaux manuscrits (en particulier en Inde). Pourtant, on constate le manque d'analyses détaillées des dictionnaires existant déjà. Il serait important de pouvoir établir une édition critique complète des farhangs médiévaux persans. L'auteur justifie ce postulat par leur rôle important pour la lexicologie historique de la langue persane, l'histoire de la littérature, l'analyse textuelle, l'ethnographie, la géographie historique et l'histoire de la culture (cet aspect est introduit par l'auteur pour la première fois dans les études iraniennes et ceci avec grande force).

Ce livre, écrit en langue russe, n'est malheureusement pas accompagné d'un résumé en d'autres langues. Même l'index des manuscrits est fait en écriture cyrillique (p. 154). Il s'agit de: (la transcription est toujours celle utilisée par Baevskiy, dont je fais la translittération de l'écriture cyrillique) "Adat al-fuzala", manuscrit de la Bibliothèque Nationale de Paris, n° 972; "Baxr al-faza'il", manuscrit de la Bibl. de l'Université de Teheran; "Danišname-yi Kadar-Xan", manuscrit des archives anciens de la République d'Azerbaïdjan (Baku); "Zafanguya", manuscrit de l'Université Nationale de Tachkent; "Zafanguya", manuscrit de la Bibl. de la ville de Patny (Inde), n° 3570; "Zafanguya", manuscrit de la Bibl. du Sénat (Iran), n° 527; "Zafanguya", manuscrit de la Bibl. de la ville de Marburg; "Umman al-ma'ani", manuscrit des archives anciens de l'Académie des Sciences de la République de Tadjikistan; Sarafname-yi Munyari", manuscrit de l'Institut des Etudes Orientales de l'Académie des Sciences de l'Union Soviétique, n° C311.

La bibliographie se compose aussi de dictionnaires et de manuscrits, et englobe environ 170 ouvrages en russe, tadjik, persan, et en langues européennes occidentales.

Dans l'introduction l'auteur souligne, comme chaque iranologue soviétique, que par l'appellation "langue persane du XI-XVe siècles" il entend "la langue persane-tadjik littéraire classique".

Le livre se compose de 5 chapitres;

Le premier chapitre est consacré à l'histoire détaillée de la lexicographie persane étudiée depuis le XVII^e siècle en Europe, Russie, URSS (en particulier au Tadjikistan), en Iran, Inde et au Pakistan.

Dans le II^{ème} et le III^{ème} chapitre "Lexicographie médiévale persane (période ancienne IX-X siècles)" et "Monuments de la lexicographie persane médiévale (XI—XV siècles)", Baevskiy décrit chronologiquement tous les farhangs connus de la science, en s'arrêtant sur ceux qui sont les moins étudiés.

Pour la période en question il énumère deux zones de création des dictionnaires: XI—XIV siècles — Iran, Asie Centrale, Azerbaïdjan et XIII—XV siècles — Inde.

Ce qui est uniforme, c'est la structure de la description des farhangs. Elle contient les informations suivantes: titre, date de création; auteur; composition de l'oeuvre — table des matières, type lexical, répartition et nombre de mots-souche, exemples de mots-souche et de citations; le nombre de manuscrits conservés et leurs caractéristiques de catalogue; état des recherches. D'une façon moins détaillée, l'auteur décrit les dictionnaires arabo-persan du XII—XIII siècles, tout en soulignant leur rôle de complément dans un vide créé par le manque de farhangs dans cette période.

Le plus précieux nous semble être le chapitre IV du livre: "Les principes essentiels de l'élaboration des dictionnaires encyclopédiques persans et leur développement au XI—XV^e siècles". On y retrouve 7 articles:

1. "Les farhangs du XI—XV siècles en tant que livres d'annotations aux oeuvres des classiques de la poésie persane-tadjik". En commençant par "Lugat-i furs" d'Asadi Tusi, il décrit les objectifs visés lors de leur élaboration. Il met en évidence le lexique le plus employé, c'est à dire aussi celui qui

à l'époque demandait le plus de commentaires et d'explication. Il s'agit des noms propres, des noms géographiques, des aspects des autres cultures et religions, des noms locaux des plantes et des animaux, des mots qui sont disparus de la langue.

2. "Remarques sur les caractéristiques du lexique décrit" est une analyse du lexique des phénomènes naturels.

3. "Lexique dialectal dans les anciens farhangs" qui sont d'une grande rareté et par là représentent un intérêt considérable pour les chercheurs.

4. "Eléments de grammaire dans le texte du mot-souche du dictionnaire". Ceci constitue une importante source pour les scientifiques qui travaillent sur l'évolution du système grammatical de la langue persane.

5. "Structure de l'original farhang persan" présente chronologiquement les façons de répartition des mots-souche dans les farhangs ainsi que la structure du mot-souche; le titre; synonyme; texte explicatif; fonction; prononciation; renvoi aux farhangs antérieurs; exemples d'utilisation en poésie.

6. "Façons de désigner la prononciation dans les farhangs". Ce thème n'a pas été étudié à fond jusqu'à l'heure actuelle.

7. "Méthodes de documentation dans les farhangs". Dans ce passage Baevskiy arrive à identifier un grand nombre de citations non-documentées. Nous pourrions ajouter que des expressions du type "le poète a dit..." ou "ce grand (homme) a dit..." restent utilisées dans la littérature scientifique persane contemporaine.

Le chapitre V "Les farhangs en tant que source de l'histoire de la culture" constitue une sorte de réponse à l'appel d'I.M. Oranskiy "Vostochnye yazyki i kul'tura narodov Vostoka" — Langues orientales et la culture des peuples d'Orient (Narody Azii i Afriki, 1977, 4) pour la mise en évidence de cet aspect, car les farhangs jouaient le rôle d'encyclopédie de leurs temps et présentaient la vision du monde telle que devait l'avoir un Persan médiéval. Baevskiy fait ressurgir de nombreux exemples du domaine de l'habitat, de la construction, des outils de travail, des objets ménagers, des armes, de l'administration, de la vie quotidienne, des noms de parenté, des professions et des états, etc. Il constate un nombre relativement restreint de description des coutumes. Dans ce chapitre (pp. 122 et 125) pour la quatrième fois, auparavant pp. 22, 90/91, 116, nous pouvons lire sur la nécessité de présenter les farhangs, ce qui selon moi traduit un didactisme quelque peu excessif.

Le livre s'achève par "l'Index des farhangs persans jusqu'au XVIII^e siècle" précédé d'une bibliographie de ce sujet. La liste comporte 100 farhangs (par un astérisque on a indiqué les oeuvres non conservées — au nombre de 44) avec le titre et les variantes, le nom de l'auteur et la période de la création (en date de l'hégire). La liste est élaborée en persan, ce qui la rend accessible à tous les iranologues.

De cette brève description de la monographie de Baevskiy il découle indiscutablement, qu'elle devrait constituer un élément important dans le développement des études iraniennes. Il faudrait cependant regretter que l'auteur n'ait pas employé la transcription scientifique internationale dans les mots persans ainsi que dans les noms propres (bien que les citations plus longues des farhangs soient présentées en persan).

Barbara Mękarska

„Asian Pacific Language and Communication: Foundations, Issues and Directions” Prologue to the *Journal of Asian Pacific Communication* Vol. 1, 1990 (Multilingual Matters) by Vngela Williams, Howard Giles and Herbert D. Pierson.

Launching a new scholarly journal is an interesting and challenging event. The inaugural issue should include not only carefully selected articles, but also a clear presentation of the objectives the editors wish to pursue.

The first issue of the *Journal of Asian Pacific Communication*, edited by Howard Giles and Herbert D. Pierson, published in July 1990 by Multilingual Matters, fulfils these requirements.

Angela Williams, Howard Giles and Herbert D. Pierson, the authors of the Prologue to the Journal, outline the objectives in a coherent way, not only discussing the theoretical foundations, but giving interesting examples as well.

The aim of the journal is to provide a forum for interdisciplinary studies on languages and communication in the region of Southeast Asia which includes Burma, China, Hong Kong, Indonesia, Japan, Kampuchea, Korea, Laos, Malaysia, the Philippines, Singapore, Taiwan, Thailand and Vietnam.

The authors of the Prologue briefly discuss the following themes: Value Systems and Philosophical Traditions, Language and the Media, Language Policies and Language Planning, Language Shift and Change: Loan Words, Bilingualism and Second Language Learning, Language and Immigration, and Interpersonal Communication.

Presenting and discussing such a broad range of themes, the editors promise the readers to provide them with profound studies of South Pacific language and communication issues against the cultural and philosophical backgrounds. This promise materializes in the contents of Volume 1 which includes the following articles: "Polyglossia in the 'Printed Cantonese' Mass Media in Hong Kong" by Terence Lo and Colleen Wong, "The Development of Multicultural Stability in ASEAN: The Role of Mass Media" by John A. Lent, "Loan Words in Japanese" by Don R. McCreary, "Language as a Seismograph of Acculturation: Sociolinguistic Parameters of Language Contacts in the Asian Context" by Harald Haarmann, "From Business to Pidgin" by Philip Baker and Peter Mühlhäusler, "Korean Sociolinguistic Attitudes in Japanese Comparative Perspective" by R.A. Brown, "Japanese Foreigner Talk: Convergence or Divergence?" by Steven Ross and Ian M. Shortreed, "The Dynamics of the Hong Kong Accent: Social Identity and Sociolinguistic Description" by Kingsley Bolton and Helen Kwok, "The Role of Self-Reported Language Proficiencies in the Cultural and Psychosocial Adaptation Among Members of Toronto, Canada's Chinese Community" by Karen K. Dion, Kenneth L. Dion and Anita Wan-Ping Pak, "Communication and Adaptation: The Case of Asian Pacific Refugees in the United States" by Young Yun Kim, "Cantonese-Chinese Vitality in London, England" by Itesh Sachdev, Richard Y. Bourhis, John D'Eye and Sue-wen Phang, "Language as

a Core Value of Culture Among Tertiary Students of Chinese and Indian Origin in Australia" by J.J. Smolicz, L. Lee, M. Murugaian and M.J. Secombe, and "Oriental and Canadian Conversational Interactions; Chronographic Structure and Interpersonal Perception" by Stanley Feldstein and Cynthia L. Crown.

Danuta Stanulewicz