

violinist). He also recorded a set of 18 Hotentot songs, sung by himself. In 1957 he was appointed professor at the Jagiellonian University. Though he retired in 1965, he never stopped his scholarly activities, and he was still lecturing at home at the age of 99! In 1985 he was appointed honorary president of the Language Origins Society, of which he was one of the founders. Active till the end of his life, Roman Stopa died in Cracow on April 15, 1995.

Stopa's complete bibliography is being printed. It displays a huge variety of interests pursued with a deep knowledge of the subjects, from linguistics, through ethnology, to the origins of speech. In his lifetime, had become a "monument", today he leaves behind a scholarly monument "aere perennius", and he goes on living in the hearts of all those who had chance to meet him and discover his warm and charismatic personality.

Przemysław PIEKARSKI

GEORGE L. BATA

COMMENTS ON A CONTRIBUTION TO THE TRANSLATION OF IBN FADLĀN

The only extant transcript of Ibn Fadlān's *Risāla* on his travel to the King of Volga-Bulghar, *alias dictus* the King of the Ṣaḡāliba (ملك الصقالبة) in 921/922 AD, is either a copy of the original MS, or a copy of a previous copy of the original. There exist also extracts preserved by Yāqūt. They are all subject to the usual copyists' errors, requiring appropriate editing and emendations. This makes the translation of the text particularly difficult at places, and an erroneous translation leads easily to additional errors and to unjustified conjectures.

A typical source of error in Islamic MSS is often a native Persian copyist, writing and misunderstanding Arabic. There are many loanwords between the two languages, and many homophones and homonyms. Nevertheless, if handled with sufficient caution, the recognition and emendation of such errors may lead to new knowledge³. The sentence in the *Risāla* we are analyzing here is a good example

¹ McGill University, Montréal, Québec, Canada

² We are referring to A. K m i e t o w i c z, Contribution à la traduction d'Ibn Fadlān, "Folia Orientalia" 28(1991)79

³ Other examples in Greek and Persian copyists may be found in G.L. B a t a, The Personal Names of the Early Árpáds, "Journal of Turkish Studies" 13(1989)15; *I d e m*, Lebedia Revisited, *i b i d.* 16(1992)1.; *I d e m*, The Turks who were Called Σαβαρτοι Ασφαλοι, subm. for publ.; P. B. G o l d e n, The Byzantine Greek Elements in the

to demonstrate this source of error. The Arabic MS in question was preserved in the library of Meshed, which at that time was part of Iran, and this makes it even more probable that the copy was made by a Persian hand⁴.

A significant and helpful emendation has been offered by the late professor Andrzej Czapkiewicz to one of the enigmatic *loci* of the Risāla, as it has been reported recently by Ms. A. Kmietowicz⁵. She is also known, in her own right, to be an expert on the subject. Our comments here are expanding on their contribution.

The enigmatic *locus* in question reads as follows, based on the facsimile edition of the MS by professor Kovalevskij⁶: راس الجوارى الشعير الا ان يكون راس (١):
نيس (٧) فيطمع من اللحم.

This text is in the form as it has been emended by us. The justifications for these emendations are given further below, and any deviation from the MS is noted.

Frähn, the first translator of the Risāla based on Yāqūt's extract, already hundred and sixty years ago remarked, when he reached this paragraph: "Hier folgen im Arabischen Texte noch ein Paar Worte (!), deren Sinn mir nicht klar ist"⁷. Yāqūt himself dropped the latter half of this paragraph in his extract. Zeki Validi Togan working on the Meshed MS expressed similar frustrations, although his copy contained the complete paragraph in question.

Rasūlid Hexaglot, "Archivum Eurasiae Medii Aevi" 5(1985[1987])41-166.

⁴ I would like to thank Mr. Adam G a s e k of the Institute for Islamic Studies of McGill University, for his help with the reading of the Arabic texts.

⁵ See note 2.

⁶ К о в а л е в с к и й , А. П. , Книга Ахмэда Ибн-фадлана, Харьков 1956, fol. 206b, lines 15-17. Cf. Zeki V a l i d i T o g a n, transl. and ed., "Abh.f.d.Kunde d. Morgenlandes" 24[3](1939) Par.59 on pp. 62f and ٧٨. "Sie machen aus der Gerste eine Brühe, die die Mädchen und Jünglinge trinken. Häufig kochen sie die Gerste mit Fleisch, dann essen die Herren das Fleisch und die Sklavinnen die Gerste, wenn aber (das Fleisch) vom Kopf des ... 'ns ist, dann läßt man (auch sie) vom Fleisch essen". The translator himself expressed doubts about his text.

⁷ Ch. M. F r a e h n , Die ältesten arabischen Nachrichten ueber die Volga-Bulgharen (28 March, 1832), in facsimile in Haarmann H. ed., Die Erforschung arabischer Quellen, Hamburg (1976). p.575, n. 48

First however, let us see the currently accepted translation of the whole paragraph where this phrase is to be found. Talking about the culinary habits of the people in Volga-Bulghar, Ibn Faḍlān says:

" Ils font avec de l'orge une bouillie que mangent les jeune esclaves filles et garçons. Parfois ils font cuire l'orge avec la viande : les maîtres mangent la viande et ils donnent l'orge à manger aux filles esclaves, mais si cette viande est de la tête du bouc, ils leur en donnent à manger " ⁸.

This phrase does not make much sense, and the enigma continues to exist.

Based on emendation (٧) the phrase above has been changed by Ms. Kmietowicz⁹ to read "... les maîtres mangent la viande et les filles esclaves, l'orge, et ce n'est que lorsque c'est une pièce précieuse, qu'elle mange de la viande".

With the introduction of the amendment "une pièce précieuse", the translation is substantially improved, but is still lame. We would like to think, that with emendation (١) substituting "l'orge" for "pièce" we have finally made the last step to make this phase intelligible: "... les maîtres mangent la viande et les filles esclaves mangent l'orge, et ce n'est que lorsque l'orge vannée est chère, qu'elle mange de la viande"¹⁰.

There are only two amendments necessary:

(١) MS راس . The original may have read راس " a heap of barley (corn) winnowed, threshed or trodden out " in Persian, instead of رأس "head" in

⁸ Translation by M. C a n a r d , trans.ed., Ibn Faḍlān, Voyage chez les Bulgares de la Volga, Paris 1988, p.62. The latest edition of the Arabic text is by S. a d - D a h h a n , Risala Ibn Faḍlān , Damascus 1959, p. 130. The Italics is mine to highlight the translation corresponding to the text in Arabic, given above.

⁹ See note 2

¹⁰ L'orge vannée is a Persian term (راس) and it stands for thrashed and winnowed barley, or corn in general. These processes reduced the husk and the smaller broken grains in the crop and made it suitable for consumption. Cf. S t e i n g a s s , 563.

Arabic¹¹, which is spelled without diacritical marks in the MS. This amendment also resolves the apparent problem of the gender and there is no need to attempt to explain the lack of the form رأس in the MS. We will return to this topic with other examples. The use of Persian is justified, as at that time a Persian dialect was still in use in Khwāresm, and there were many Khwāresmians in Ibn Fadlān's caravan. The hand of the only MS extant is also obviously Persian, written in Naskh.

(٢) MS نفيس . We can thank professor Czapkiewicz for the vocalization of this word to نفيس meaning "précieuse", "costly", "valuable", "expensive"¹². It is this emendation of his, which triggered the thought process which led us to further corrections, as reported in this paper.

Returning to the رأس : راس = "head" : "barley" misunderstanding, there are at least four additional loci in Islamic historiography, where the same mistake may have occurred, namely:

(a) According to Ṭabarī, during the trial of Afshīn in 839/40 AD, the disparaging remark was made concerning the mercenary troops called Maghāriḥa, that المغاربة *أَكَلَةُ رَأْسٍ* : "they are only eaters of a head"¹³. Afshīn is reported to be a Mazdakite heretic having secret contacts with Khazaria and Khwārezm. Could it be that a sarcastic nickname like "barley-eaters" is meant to apply to the troops here? The editor-translator Nöldeke defers to Lane, who's dictionary is quoted below.

(b) Lane seems to confirm this meaning of "barley eaters" given above, which is reputedly taken from the Ṣiḥāḥ (ca 1002 AD). This does not necessarily make it independent from Ṭabarī (ca 870 AD). Lane states : "You say, *أَكَلَةُ رَأْسٍ* [lit. *They are eaters of a head*]; meaning they are few; one head satisfying their stomachs." He himself had some doubts with this interpretation however and

¹¹ Steingass 562.

¹² Wehr, 1156

¹³ Al-Ṭabarī, The Reign of al-Mu'taṣim, E. Marin transl., "American Oriental Series", New Haven, Conn. 1951, vol.35, p. 118. and p. ١٣١٢, line 4

specified it as tropical¹⁴ i.e. metaphorical. Such a metaphore is somewhat odd. Here too, "head" and "barley" may have been interchanged in an original "barley eaters".

(c) We find an other interpretation, when we turn to the heading Ṣiqlāb in the Turkish Qāmūs : "... on dit aussi Rées Sziqlāb (une tête Sziqlāb) رأس (صقلاب) pour désigner une tête dure ..." ¹⁵. However it goes on to say that the word Sziqlāb also "... signifie un homme et un animal voraces et gloutons." The plural of sziqlāb (recte : ṣiqlāb) is aṣ-Ṣaqāliba (الصقالب), exactly the name of the people under the King of Volga-Bulghar (as mentioned in the very beginning of this paper), where the whole barley eating scenario is played out. Here again, are we facing a "head" and "barley" misunderstanding, and possibly the Ṣaqāliba were also called at one time "barley eaters" (أَكَلَةُ رَأْسٍ)?

(d) There is another interesting locus in the Pahlavi translation of the Avestā referring to -- but apparently conflicting with -- the Mazdakite prohibition of eating the meat of dead animals, and of killing animals. Surprising is then the statement in the same book, that "... Mazdak ... who ate heads ... fights against ... etc.", as translated by Nöldeke¹⁶. Some eighty years later, perhaps to avoid this conflict, Otakar Klima¹⁷ is even more cautious translating the above mentioned phrase of "... Mazdak ... who ate heads ..." to read that "... Mazdak ... who gorged himself ..." Avoiding completely the mention of the term "head" leaves the sentence without any sensible meaning. Nevertheless if

we realize, that here again the Arabic رأس and the Persian راس are mixed up, as before, then the original text can be restored to read "... Mazdak ... who ate barley ..." or Mazdak, the barley eater.

¹⁴ Lane 73

¹⁵ The French transliteration is outdated. H. Haarmann, idem. M. Ch a r m o y on p. 307.; Cf. Qāmūs of Fī r ū z ā b ā d ī, Scutari edition, vol.1., p.181, s.v. الصقلاب

¹⁶ Th. N ö l d e k e, ed., Geschichte der Perser und Araber zur Zeit der Sasaniden - by Tabari, Leyden 1879 (reprt. 1973), p. 460. "... Mazdak, welcher den Kopf ass ... der kämpft gegen ... etc"

¹⁷ O. K l i m a, Mazdak, Prague 1957, reprt. 1979, pp. 192, 286. Mazdak taught a syncretic judeo-manichaeen gnostic heresy, with communistic tendencies. A persecuted sect, it found wide followings in Central Asia and in Iraq at the time of Ibn Fadlān's travel. Cf. E I, s.v. Mazdak

The Mazdakites confessed a Judaizing Manichaeian religion with communistic overtones, which by the 9th century apparently became a gnostic Judeo-Muslim syncretic Shiite sect under the name المغارية or المغاربة (Maghāriya or Maghāriha)¹⁸

It is interesting to note Altheim's reasoned conclusion elsewhere, that Mazdak himself was a native of Khwārezm: "Mazdak entstammte selbst Chwārezm oder dessen Nachbarschaft und trat dort erstmals hervor".¹⁹

Who are these "barley eaters"?

We have seen that the nickname "barley eater" on different occasions was applied

- (a) to people in Volga-Bulghar;
- (b) the Ṣaḡālība²⁰;
- (c) mercenary troops, called Maghāriha;
- (d) followers of Mazdak, and the latter may have had possible connections with Khwārezm.

The entirety of these designations is neatly applicable to the standing army of the Khazars called the Arsīya (الارسية), as described by Mas'ūdī²¹: "Les Musulmans

¹⁸ Asch-Schachrastānī's Religionsparteien und Philosophen-Schulen, T. Haarbrücker trad., Halle 1850, vol. I, pp. 171, 200ff, 221, 255-7, 280, 291-3; vol. II, 410, 415, 419; Albirūnī, The Chronology of Ancient Nations, C.E. Sachau trad., ed., London 1879, pp. 192, 194, 278, 314; A. P a u l, Écrits de Qumran et sectes juives aux premiers siècles de l'islam, Paris 1969, pp. 90-96.

¹⁹ Franz Altheim, Geschichte d. Hunnen, Berlin 1961, vol. III, p. 72.

²⁰ The Ṣaḡālība of Ibn Faḍlān can be equated with the peoples of Volga-Bulghar according to Zeki Validi Togan [l.c. pp. 295-331] and the Turkish Qāmūs [s.v.]. In an other paper [G.L. B a t a, The Turks Who Were Called Σαβαρτοι Ασφαλοι, "Journal of Turkish Studies", subm. for publ.] I attempt to show that the so called Turks (= proto-Hungarians) of Constantine Porphyrogenitus were called Cavalry of the Ṣaḡālība, or Cavalry of the Guard, and had the rôle of the vanguard in the mercenary army of the Khazars. Their base was called Lebedia, located in the region of the Volga-Kama rivers.

²¹ Mas'ūdī, Les prairies d'or, Barbier de Meynard et Pavet de Courteille trad., C. Pellat ed., Paris 1962, vol. I, p. 162.

dominant en Khazarie parce que ce sont eux qui composent l'armée royale; ils sont connus sous le nom d'al-Arsiyya. Originaires des environs du Khwāresm, ils sont venus depuis longtemps s'établir dans le royaume des Khazars, peu après l'apparition de l'Islam . . . [Ils] ne combatteraient pas leurs coreligionnaires . . . Aujourd'hui, environs 7 000 d'entre eux forment les archer à cheval du roi . . ."

The Arsīya was most probably deployed on the Northern marches of Khazaria, like in Volga-Bulghar, where they did not have to fight against Muslims.

We can only speculate, and wildly at that, whether there is more than an apparent connection between the "barley eater" Ṣaḡālība in Volga-Bulghar and the vegetarian "barley eater" followers of Mazdak. One could conjecture the existence of possible connections through Mazdakite Khwāresmians serving in the mercenary army of the Khazars probably stationed in Volga-Bulghar, along lines already suggested by Tolstov²².

It is not unheard of to name a people after their eating habits. Ptolemaios mentioned an ethnic group living in the North called Μοδόκαϊ, who were later called Ἀμύδοκοι by Stephanos Byzantios (fl. ca 528-35 AD). The two names are the same, meaning "raw meat eaters"²³.

We may ask: is there any connection between the

- (a) Judaizing Maghāriha gnostic sect revived in the 9th century,
- (b) the Jewish Khazars²⁴,
- (c) the "barley eating" mercenaries called Maghāriha among the Turkish "slave" troops,
- (d) the Maghāriha mercenaries recruited by Abū Hāmid²⁵ two-hundred years after Ibn Faḍlān, near Volga-Bulghar, and

²² S.P. Tolstov, Auf den Spuren der altchoresmischen Kultur, Berlin 1953, 239-250

²³ É. Korenchý, Iranische Lehnwörter in den obugrischen Sprachen, Budapest 1972, pp. 36f, where she also mentions a 13th century Russian source about a people living in the Volga-Kama river region, called Сыроядцы i.e. "raw meat eater".

²⁴ D.M. Dunlop, The History of the Jewish Khazars, Princeton 1954; The Judaizing religion adopted by the Khazars may have been that of the Maghāriha according to M. Gyóni, Kalizok, kazárok, kabarok, magyarok, "Magyar Nyelv" 34(1938)86-96, 159-168.

²⁵ Abū Hāmid el Granadino, Relación de viaje por tierras eurasiáticas, C.E. Dubler trad., ed., Madrid 1953, pp. 5f, 25, 27f, 39, 50f, 64-66, 73f. He describes his journey to Volga-Bulghar and to Hungary in 1131 to 1153 AD.

(e) the followers of Mazdak ?

It may be safer, for the time being, to hold back on such intriguing speculation triggered by simple *lapsus linguae* or *lapsus calami* of a copyist. The surmises are still tenuous and there is no adequate proof. Additional data may lead us though, eventually, to new knowledge.

----- * * * *-----

JEFFREY C. BURKE

THE EPIGRAPHIC COIN REFORM OF °ABD AL-MALIK

Introduction

My interest in numismatics began at a young age. An elderly man in our town's local numismatic society introduced me to the joys of coin collecting. His lessons included the identification of mint marks, errors made in the printing process, and the ability to discern particular designs of coins covering certain time periods. The ordinary person might think of coin collecting as a mundane task but I had fun imagining the significant historical events which took place when my coins were minted. Coins should not be viewed as inanimate pieces of metal. Instead, they should be thought of as representatives of the thoughts and aspirations of living peoples who transmitted some of their ideas via the mass production of tiny metal objects. It takes a special skill to accurately interpret the messages of these coins without being hoodwinked by counterfeits. The late Nicholas Lowick, former Curator of Oriental Coins at the British Museum, lists three main points about the proper identification of Islamic coins: "...the accurate reading of inscriptions, the recording of coin hoards and finds, and the relating of numismatic data to the literary sources."¹

I will never forget the excitement of owning a 1925 two-and-one-half dollar (U.S.) gold piece in mint condition. Suddenly, this time period in history became my consuming passion. This gold piece helped me to better understand the political